
**CANADIAN BROADCAST STANDARDS COUNCIL
NATIONAL SPECIALTY SERVICES PANEL**

Talentvision re a News Report (Mainland China Murders)

(CBSC Decision 01/02-0416+)

Decided May 3, 2002

R. Cohen (Chair), P. O'Neill (Vice-Chair), R. Cugini, R. Deverell, E. Duffy-MacLean,
M. Hogarth and F. Niemi

THE FACTS

At about 8:30 pm on December 16, 2001, the Chinese-language broadcaster Talentvision TV aired a segment of the Mainland China broadcaster Chinese Central Television (CCTV) *Chinese Satellite News* which featured a news story on Fu Yi-bin, who was accused with having killed his wife and his father. The segment began with a view of the outside of the building in which the murders had taken place and then cut back and forth four times between the blood-soaked walls of the apartment and an interview with the accused, which, on one occasion, was followed by a brief statement from a police officer. The item concluded with a video bit on an unidentified person practising Falun Gong and some shots of cassettes and books. A Talentvision news anchor introduced the tape of the news item, which had been supplied by CCTV. The voice-over was by the CCTV reader; the accused and the police officer were interviewed on-screen.

The translation was supplied to the CBSC by Talentvision. Two members of the Falun Dafa Association of Canada, the principal complainant in this matter, reviewed the broadcaster's English-language transcript along with the video tape of the news item and proposed some changes, all of which, except one (the closing CCTV newsreader statement), were accepted by Talentvision. The CBSC then sought its own expert opinion of that closing statement and it is the CBSC-generated version that is included in the translation provided here. In the interests of completeness, the Talentvision and Falun Dafa versions are also given following the CBSC's amalgamated transcript.

Talentvision Anchor: On the 25th, in Beijing, a Falun Gong follower brutally murdered his father and wife, and seriously injured his mother with his own hands. The means he used to kill his parents and wife was extremely cruel. He explained that this would send him and his family to the *World of Ultimate Bliss* where they could share eternal happiness.

- CCTV VO:* The murderer is named Fu Yi-bin. Police officers who arrived at the scene said they were all shocked at the sight of this extreme cruelty. Fu Yi-bin explained his motivations for his crime in an interrogation.
- Fu Yi-bin:* After I killed the three of them, their spirit and their body would enter my lower abdomen directly. There, they will form a universal system similar to the one of the Sun, the Earth, and the Moon. This system will rotate in my Dantian [lower abdomen area], which is the central foundation of the rotating Falun.
- CCTV VO:* In order to achieve individual completion [or perfection], Fu Yi-bin brutally chopped his father and wife to death, and seriously injured his mother.
- Fu Yi-bin:* I am no longer a human being. I have ascended to become a supernatural being. A supernatural being does not have emotions.
- Policeman:* According to Fu Yi-bin himself, his wife was crawling towards the elevator, wanting to seek help by banging on the elevator's gate. Attempting to avoid this being seen, Fu Yi-bin took hold of his wife's hands and legs, hauling her back to this door from the elevator.
- Fu Yi-bin:* Then I got exhausted and rested on the sofa. Helpers arrived and tried to resuscitate them, saying "this one's still breathing, let's rescue this one"... Who could still be rescued? They were already minced! What's the point of saving their lives? This goes to show you the importance human beings place on the physical body of a person!
- CCTV VO:* According to investigation, the suspect, Fu Yi-bin, was a caring and loving son and husband. All that changed when he started practising Falun Gong in 1998. Being obsessed with and influenced through, and spiritually controlled by Li Hong-zhi and the Falun Gong evil cult organization, he marched toward the edge of criminality until he became so utterly inhumane as to murder his father and wife.

The Talentvision translation of the final CCTV statement follows:

- CCTV VO:* According to investigation, the suspect, Fu Yi-bin, was a caring and loving son and husband. All that changed when he started practising Falun Gong in 1998. After indulging in, being influenced through, and spiritually controlled by Li Hong-zhi and the Falun Gong evil cult organization, he marched toward the edge of criminality until he became so utterly inhumane as to murder his father and wife.

The Falun Dafa Association translation of the final CCTV statement follows:

- CCTV VO:* According to investigation, the suspect, Fu Yi-bin, was a caring and loving son and husband. All that changed when he started practising Falun Gong in 1998 and became obsessed. Being influenced through, and spiritually controlled by Li Hong-zhi and the Falun Gong evil cult organization, he marched toward the edge of criminality until he became so utterly inhumane as to murder his father and wife.

Complaints were sent to either the CRTC or the CBSC directly by twenty individuals, one of which (from the Falun Dafa Association of Canada) was signed by 1,282 people. All of the files ultimately arrived in the hands of the CBSC.

The petition, which expressed the general position of the Association regarding the Chinese Government and the relationship between the two, stated in principal part (the full text of the petition and all of the correspondence can be found in the Appendix):

Whereas [...] TalentVision TV [... has] broadcast programming by Chinese Central Television (CCTV) which has defamed and inspired hate against Falun Gong practitioners in Toronto; and

Whereas CCTV is a Chinese government state run programmer whose mandate is to promote the directives, views and propaganda of the Chinese Communist government; and

[...]

Whereas the unlawful persecution of Falun Gong in China is now being perpetuated in Canada via live, unscreened satellite feeds of CCTV hate inspiring programming in the form of Chinese government propaganda being broadcast over Canadian airwaves which is causing direct harm to Falun Gong practitioners in Canada [...]

The petition was accompanied by two letters, which were more specifically related to the challenged newscast. The first said in part:

The story about Falun Gong reflected the bias and ignorance of the reporter and the program producer. It portrayed Falun Gong practitioners to be mentally ill people. Its derogatory [*sic*] tone and remarks about Falun Gong made the audience become hostile towards the people that practise it.

[...]

It was very evident that the 30-minute news reports are a reproduction of news from the CCTV Channel 4 of China. CCTV is a state-controlled network.

It is absolutely unacceptable to me to see CCTV 4 news being freely broadcasted [*sic*] in Canada, spreading lies and deceiving innocent Canadians.

Falun Gong is a spiritual practice that teaches one how to lives [*sic*] his/her life according to the universal principle Truthfulness-Compassion-Tolerance. [...]

It would be greatly appreciated if CRTC could look into the situation and request Talentvision to stop spreading lies and promoting hatred among Chinese Canadians.

The second letter read in principal part as follows:

We are writing to you out of serious concern regarding the fact that Chinese Central Television (CCTV), the official mouthpiece of the Chinese Communist Government, is now broadcasting and airing hate-inspiring propaganda on our Canadian airwaves. As Falun Gong practitioners here in Canada, we have been directly affected by this harmful programming. We would like to bring this inappropriate broadcasting to your attention and we hope that together with your help we can quickly resolve this matter and prevent such slanderous and hate-inspiring programmes from being aired in the future.

CCTV is a state-run programmer of the Chinese Government and has the mandate to promote the directives and views of the Chinese Communist Party. Included in these

directives is the current brutal and widespread persecution and defamation of practitioners of Falun Gong, a peaceful spiritual practice that is enjoyed by millions in China and many here in Canada as well.

Live and unscreened satellite feeds of CCTV are now being passed directly from China onto Canadian cable television stations, carrying propaganda that is attacking, slandering and inspiring hate against those who practise Falun Gong.

On December 16, 2001, the newly licensed Chinese broadcast station Talentvision TV aired a segment of CCTV's "Chinese Satellite News" in which a news story exhibited graphic, brutal images of mutilated bodies covered in blood lying in a blood-soaked apartment. This news segment looked much like a graphic horror film. The news announcer proceeded to claim that this act was committed by a Falun Gong practitioner. The accused "Falun Gong practitioner" then appeared in an interview, freely answering questions aimed at defaming Falun Gong. We would like to affirm that Falun Gong, its teachings and its practitioners are entirely peaceful and prohibit all forms of violence and killing. These broadcasts are damaging and hurtful to those good people who practise Falun Gong as they help to fuel the Chinese government's persecution campaign in China. They have used their defamation claims to justify their harsh persecution.

[...]

According to Article 5(1) of CRTC's *Television Broadcasting Regulations, 1987*:

A licensee shall not broadcast

- (a) anything in contravention of the law;
- (b) any abusive comment or abusive pictorial representation that, when taken in context, tends to or is likely to expose an individual or a group or class of individuals to hatred or contempt on the basis of race, national or ethnic origin, colour, religion, sex, sexual orientation, age or mental or physical disability;
- (c) any obscene or profane language or pictorial representation; or
- (d) any false or misleading news.

We feel that CCTV broadcasts clearly contravene (b), (c) and (d). In terms of the intention of this propaganda to inspire hate against innocent people because of their belief in Falun Gong, we also feel it is also in contradiction to (a). [...]

The President of Talentvision responded to all of the complainants in the month of January in the following terms:

This news item, produced by China Central TV ("CCTV"), reported on a multiple killing case in China, where the alleged murderer, shown as a middle-aged Chinese man, butchered his parents and his wife in their home; confessed to be a Falun Gong practitioner; and claimed his behaviour was part of his process in making his Falun Gong practice complete.

Your comments towards the coverage of the news story may be summarized as follows:

- 1) Since CCTV is controlled by the Chinese Government, it is largely a propaganda tool and as such its news production should not be aired in Canada;
- 2) The news footage contained graphic scenes including dead bodies and pools of blood that were inappropriate to air;

- 3) The reporting defamed the Falun Gong movement implying that it caused insanity and acts of violence; and
- 4) By airing this murder case, Talentvision has no compassion for, and helped promulgating [*sic*] hatred toward, Falun Gong members.

We regret that you were offended and/or extremely disturbed by this story, and that some of you even seemed to have interpreted the broadcast as Talentvision=s deliberate attempt to assist CCTV and the Chinese Government. Upon receipt of your complaints, we have reviewed objectively and carefully the appropriateness of airing the story, re-evaluating our decision in light of your concerns. We would like to address each of the above concerns with the following response:

- 1) Talentvision primarily serves Mandarin-speaking Chinese Canadians and in its mandate provides news that is of interest to its viewers. This includes Canadian news, world news and news from the homelands of many viewers, namely Mainland China and Taiwan. We make use of the best news sources available; for news from Mainland China and Taiwan this includes organizations based in these countries. Being State-owned does not disqualify CCTV from being a legitimate news source. However, Talentvision is sensitive to the programming that is aired in Canada and where appropriate, not all items available from foreign sources are broadcast on our station.

- 2) The story reported on a heinous and violent act. While graphic details were televised of the bloodied scene, no picture of the bodies was aired contrary to comments made by some viewers. A warning of the graphic nature of any type of potentially disturbing upcoming footage would be well-advised in the future.

- 3) In our view, the story reported that the alleged killer was insane, and in his insanity, had formed some warped rationale for the murders, which involved his notions of Falun Gong. We did not believe our viewers would infer that practising Falun Gong would lead to insanity and acts of violence. Canadians are familiar with Falun Gong, thanks in part to the media attention Talentvision and other western media companies have given Falun Gong in educating the public on its values and beliefs. We can assure you that Talentvision was by no means attempting to criticize or evaluate Falun Gong and Falun Dafa=s followers.

- 4) Talentvision has had a long history of adhering very closely to the regulations set for Canadian broadcasters and uses every effort in maintaining a fair, neutral and balanced position in our news broadcasts. We have, since the inception of Falun Gong, provided our audience with many opportunities to gain a better understanding of the various views, issues and angles related to the practice. Consequently, there was no reason for us to believe that the December 16 news report, where the insanity rather than the practice of Falun Gong was the overriding characteristic of the alleged criminal, would inspire hatred of Falun Gong practitioners.

The material=s source was clearly stated as CCTV and any skepticism regarding the authenticity of the murders, alleged murderer and his involvement in practising Falun Gong are subject to the credibility of this source. Talentvision will not knowingly act as a propaganda agent for anyone and believes very strongly in human rights and the freedom of the press. In allowing our audience this view into China via CCTV and given Falun Gong=s status in China, perhaps it would have been prudent before/after the segment aired for our news announcer to have reminded our viewers of the source of this program and the differing status of Falun Gong in both countries.

Of the twenty complainants, thirteen returned their Ruling Requests. The Falun Dafa Association's Ruling Request was accompanied by a letter which stated in part:

I am sorry to inform you that we are not satisfied with your response. In your letter you made an effort to summarize our complaint into 5 points. I felt our complaint can simply be summarized in the following:

Since China started to crack down on Falun Gong in July 1999, CCTV has never shown anything but severely distorted views of Falun Gong. The role CCTV has been playing on this matter is to spread orchestrated lies about Falun Gong to demonize this innocent group and justify the Chinese authority's persecution. CCTV's news regarding Falun Gong is false and misleading. These news [*sic*] incites hate and should not be aired in Canada.

The letter went on to cite correspondence from Amnesty International and other sources. Considerable documentation was also annexed to the correspondence. The Association letter also stated:

The teaching of Falun Gong forbids killing, including suicide. Please find attached to this letter, section "The Issue of Killing" in Chapter 7 of Zhuan Falun, the main book that expounded the teaching of Falun Gong, where Mr. Li, Hongzhi stressed time and again that practitioners of Falun Gong cannot kill lives [*sic*].

THE DECISION

The National Specialty Services Panel considered the complaint under the following provisions of the Canadian Association of Broadcasters (CAB) *Code of Ethics, Voluntary Code regarding Violence in Television Programming* and the Radio and Television News Directors Association of Canada (RTNDA) *Code of (Journalistic) Ethics*:

CAB Code of Ethics, Clause 6 (News):

It shall be the responsibility of member stations to ensure that news shall be represented with accuracy and without bias. The member station shall satisfy itself that the arrangements made for obtaining news ensure this result. It shall also ensure that news broadcasts are not editorial. News shall not be selected for the purpose of furthering or hindering either side of any controversial public issue, nor shall it be designed by the beliefs or opinions or desires of the station management, the editor or others engaged in its preparation or delivery. The fundamental purpose of news dissemination in a democracy is to enable people to know what is happening, and to understand events so that they may form their own conclusions.

[...]

It is recognized that the full, fair and proper presentation of news, opinion, comment and editorial is the prime and fundamental responsibility of the broadcast publisher.

CAB Violence Code, Article 6.0 (News & Public Affairs Programming):

- 6.1 Broadcasters shall use appropriate editorial judgment in the reporting of, and the pictorial representation of violence, aggression or destruction within their news and public affairs programming.
- 6.2 Caution shall be used in the selection of, and repetition of, video which depicts violence.

RTNDA Code of (Journalistic) Ethics, Article 1 (Accuracy):

Broadcast journalists will inform the public in an accurate, comprehensive and fair manner about events and issues of importance.

RTNDA Code of (Journalistic) Ethics, Article 2 (Equality):

Broadcast journalists will report factors such as race, national or ethnic origin, colour, religion, sexual orientation, marital status or physical or mental disability only when they are relevant.

The National Panel Adjudicators viewed a tape of the program in question and reviewed the correspondence and documentation. The Panel considers that the references to Falun Gong in the news report constituted unfair comment, on the one hand, and that the repetition of the violent video clips was excessive, on the other. It finds no fault with the broadcaster, though, in airing a newscast originating with the state-run television organ, CCTV.

Relevance of the Origin of the Newscast

Much of the concern of the Falun Dafa Association has been linked to the source of the newscast in question, namely, CCTV. As they said in their reply of March 20 to the broadcaster's letter,

Since China started to crack down on Falun Gong in July 1999, CCTV has never shown anything but severely distorted views of Falun Gong. The role CCTV has been playing on this matter is to spread orchestrated lies about Falun Gong to demonize this innocent group and justify the Chinese authority's persecution.

It is the view of the Panel that the foregoing issue is not germane to the matter under review. Whether or not the view of the Chinese Government toward Falun Gong is or is not accurately described by the Association (and the Panel expresses no view on that issue), the Panel's decision must relate solely to Talentvision and what it has broadcast. In this respect, the Panel is of the view that Talentvision's explanation of its mandate is both clear and fair:

Talentvision primarily serves Mandarin-speaking Chinese Canadians and in its mandate provides news that is of interest to its viewers. This includes Canadian news, world news and news from the homelands of many viewers, namely Mainland China and Taiwan. We make use of the best news sources available; for news from Mainland China and Taiwan this includes organizations based in these countries.

More telling is the following statement by the President of Talentvision, a Being State-owned does not disqualify CCTV from being a legitimate news source, a position to which the Panel unhesitatingly subscribes. The broadcaster has the right to choose which items from foreign sources it will air in order to serve the interests of its audience and, correspondingly, the broadcaster bears the obligation to ensure that these are not in breach of applicable laws, regulations or codes. There is no reason to *exclude* a story, news item or program on the sole basis of its *origin*. The broadcaster, duty-bound to consider its statutory, regulatory and codified responsibilities, will best exercise those by weighing the *substance* of the prospective broadcast rather than its nominal origins. While, as will be seen below, the Panel disagrees with the airing of this newscast, it is for reasons other than those proffered by the complainants. On *this* issue, it considers the broadcaster=s riposte to them entirely apt.

The Relevance of the Murderer=s Background

The Panel is not at all certain that this story would have made the news in China or in Canada but for the connection drawn by the producer of the story to an individual *alleged* to be a member of Falun Gong. Nor is it clear to the Panel that the news story has credibly established a link between the accused=s connection, if any, to Falun Gong, and the murders, as explained below. While Article 2 of the *RTNDA Code of (Journalistic) Ethics* requires that such factors as race, national or ethnic origin, colour, religion, sexual orientation, marital status or physical or mental disability are to be reported only when they are relevant, the Panel does not consider that that provision is of assistance in this matter. According to the Falun Dafa Association=s own documents, a Falun Gong is neither a religion nor a sect. [It is] a peaceful, self-improvement spiritual practice. Consequently, it would not be seen to be either a religion or any other identifiable group falling into the enumerated categories in Article 2 of the RTNDA Code expressly or by analogy. It is not, in any event, the view of the Panel that Article 2 is necessary to its conclusion in this regard.

The story, as broadcast, is tightly linked to the Falun Gong background of Fu Yi-bin, the alleged (and apparently self-confessed) murderer. It begins by identifying Fu Yi-bin in the first sentence of the report as a Falun Gong follower. It concludes by stating that Fu had been a caring and loving son and husband, which changed when he started practising Falun Gong in 1998. It then adds that his [march] toward the edge of criminality was the result of his being spiritually controlled by Li Hong-zhi [the founder of Falun Gong] and the Falun Gong evil cult organization. The Panel considers that this approach to a news story is highly unusual and irregular. If in any news context, generally speaking, there were a link between any individual and a group or association, it would only be mentioned if it either assisted in identifying the individual in the mind of the public or established a causal relationship between the link and the event. Thus, when a murder appears, for example, to result from gang rivalries, a settling of accounts, a turf dispute or the like, it may be both

relevant and in the public interest to identify the families, groups or gangs involved. Even where the head of a powerful organized family dies of natural causes, he will be generally (and justifiably) identified in his professional capacity. The connection will not, however, be woven into every section of such a story, even where that news item relates to a criminal activity. Nor would such judgmental words as evil be used to describe a motorcycle gang or an organized criminal family.

Since Fu Yi-bin was apparently not a public figure, there would certainly not have been any justification to identify him and his criminal act so constantly as Falun Gong-related. It must also be admitted that it would be most unusual, in a North American judicial environment, to have an accused making such confessions in a television interview as Fu Yi-bin made on this news segment. Had there even been such a causal relationship between the accused and Falun Gong, it would not have been reported in such a manner. The language in the sentence, his march toward the edge of criminality was the result of his being spiritually controlled by Li Hong-zhi [the founder of Falun Gong] and the Falun Gong evil cult organization is not journalism; it is nothing more or less than a biased attack on Falun Gong by the producer of that news item. Whether or not such a report is acceptable, even if not commendable, in Mainland China, the Canadian broadcaster of this imported report must ensure that it meets the standards of broadcast journalism of this country. The Panel finds that the report has not been done in a fair manner, as prescribed by Article 1 of the RTNDA Code of (Journalistic) Ethics, nor has it been fair and proper, as required by Clause 6, paragraph 3, of the CAB Code of Ethics.

Violence in the News Report

The CAB Violence Code requires of television broadcasters that appropriate editorial judgment [be used] in the reporting of, and the pictorial representation of violence [...] within their news and public affairs programming and that caution shall be used in the selection of, and repetition of, video which depicts violence. In CITY-TV re an episode of *Hard Copy* (CBSC Decision 96/97-0055, May 8, 1997), the Ontario Regional Panel applied these two important provisions to a subject in which the public had a considerable interest, namely, child abuse, and found that, while the story needed to be told, there were problems with the way that story was told. It found

that the repetition of the video segment, in whole or in part, on 9 separate occasions throughout the report was disproportionate to its relevance in presenting the story. No new information was conveyed in the repetition of the video and no new perspective was provided to the story by the repeated use of the disturbing pictures generated by the hidden surveillance camera.

The issue of repetition of violent material is specifically addressed in clause 6.2 of the Code which states that caution shall be used in the selection of, and repetition of, video which depicts violence. [Emphasis added.] The Council finds that CITY-TV failed to meet this standard in broadcasting this segment of *Hard Copy*. Moreover, the cumulative effect of the excessive repetition of the video was to distort and sensationalize the story

In *CHAN-TV re Newscast (Toronto Subway Death)* (CBSC Decision 97/98-0383, May 20, 1998), the B.C. Regional Panel dealt with a news item on a Toronto subway murder which aired on the 6:00 pm newscast of Vancouver's CHAN-TV (BCTV). A viewer complained of the inclusion in that report of a close view of the dying but still partly conscious woman's bloodstained face. The Panel found that, by including a video shot of the lacerated and bloody face of the victim, BCTV unnecessarily depicted the violence associated with that tragedy, contrary to the provisions of the *Violence Code*:

While [...] the B.C. Regional Council accepts that the news story was inherently violent and that *some* pictorial representation of the violence that occurred may have been acceptable, it finds that the shot of the victim's face as she lay dying on the paramedics' gurney was utterly unnecessary to the story. It added no clarification of any of the issues, no expository value to the sad tale, and no information which the viewer required to understand the series of events. The additional depiction could only have been calculated to make a viewer cringe or, at least, feel discomfited.

This Panel concludes similarly with respect to the reporting of the murders in China; it was fair to bring these to the attention of the public. However gruesome by its nature, murder is an offence against the state legal order in almost any country and the reporting of homicides is a matter in the public interest. There are, though, as the CBSC decisions cited above reflect, limits on reporting, which are equally in the public interest. Broadcasters and news directors have determined that *appropriate* editorial judgment shall be used in the selection of footage to accompany news stories and, as though to emphasize that point, they provide separately that *caution* shall be used in that selection as well as in the *repetition* of the footage selected. In the case at hand, there are no fewer than *four* separate video clips of the blood-soaked apartment. In the view of the Panel, the point about the particularly gruesome nature of the family murders was achieved by the use of the clip *once*; the additional airings were excessive and constituted inappropriate repetition of violent footage in a news report, contrary to the provisions of Articles 6.1 and 6.2 of the *CAB Violence Code* and Clause 6 of the *CAB Code of Ethics*.

Broadcaster Responsiveness

Broadcaster responsiveness is always an issue assessed in CBSC adjudications. The CBSC considers that the dialogue between broadcasters and complainants is an extremely positive component of the self-regulatory process; it is in fact a membership responsibility of all CBSC broadcaster members. In this case, the Panel considers that the President of Talentvision provided a very detailed and reasoned reply to the issues raised by the complainants and has thus fully complied with its obligations of responsiveness.

CONTENT OF THE ANNOUNCEMENT OF THE DECISION

Talentvision is required to: 1) announce this decision, in the following terms (translated by Talentvision into Mandarin Chinese), once during prime time within three days following the release of this decision and once more within seven days following the release of this decision during the time period in which the challenged newscast was broadcast; 2) within fourteen days following the broadcast of the announcements, to provide written confirmation of the airing of the announcements to the complainants who filed Ruling Requests; and 3) at the same time, to provide the CBSC with those written confirmations and with air check copies of the broadcasts of the two announcements which must be made by Talentvision. Since the correspondence with the complainants took place in English, it will be acceptable to the CBSC that the written confirmations in requirement (2) be provided in English.

The Canadian Broadcast Standards Council has found that Talentvision breached the Canadian Association of Broadcasters= *Code of Ethics* and *Violence Code* and the Radio and Television News Directors *Code of (Journalistic) Ethics* in its broadcast of a news item on December 16, 2001. The Council has found that the news item relating to murders committed in Mainland China was unfair and improper in its method of linking the murderer to Falun Gong, as required by Article 1 of the *RTNDA Code of (Journalistic) Ethics* and Clause 6, paragraph 3, of the *CAB Code of Ethics*. It also found that the repetitive use of video clips of the blood-soaked location of the murders constituted a breach of the requirement of broadcasters to use appropriate editorial judgment in the selection of video depictions and caution in the repetition of such footage, contrary to the requirements of Articles 6.1 and 6.2 of the *CAB Violence Code*.

This decision is a public document upon its release by the Canadian Broadcast Standards Council.

APPENDIX

CBSC File 01/02-0416+ Talentvision re a News Report (Mainland China Murders)

I. The Complaint

The following is a petition from the Falun Dafa Association of Canada signed by 1282 people. It was originally sent to the CRTC and forwarded to the CBSC in due course.

The following is the covering letter of the petition:

PETITION

To Canadian Radio-Television and Telecommunications Commission

We, the undersigned residents of Canada, draw the attention of the Canadian Radio-Television and Telecommunications Commission to the following:

Whereas, Falun Gong is a peaceful, apolitical spiritual practice, guided by the principles of Truthfulness, Compassion, and Forbearance and includes five sets of exercises in order to maintain health and a peaceful approach to life; and

Whereas TalentVision TV [...] has broadcast programming by Chinese Central Television (CCTV) which has defamed and inspired hate against Falun Gong practitioners in Toronto; and

Whereas CCTV is a Chinese government state run programmer whose mandate is to promote the directives, views and propaganda of the Chinese Communist government; and

Whereas countries around the world, including Canada and the United States, as well as numerous human rights groups such as Amnesty International, Human Rights Watch and Freedom House have openly condemned and called for an immediate cessation of the brutal persecution being carried out by the Chinese government against Falun Gong; and

Whereas the Superior Court of the Province of Quebec has recognized the damaging effect of such hate inspiring propaganda here in Canada in that it has ordered the Chinese language Canadian newspaper "La Presse Chinoise [*sic*]" to immediately cease and desist from publishing materials slanderous to Falun Gong which have included word for word copies of official propaganda of the Chinese Communist government; and

Whereas the unlawful persecution of Falun Gong in China is now being perpetuated in Canada via live, unscreened satellite feeds of CCTV hate inspiring programming in the form of Chinese government propaganda being broadcast over Canadian airwaves which is causing direct harm to Falun Gong practitioners in Canada,

We hereby call for the Canadian Radio-Television Telecommunications [*sic*] to put an immediate end to this harmful and damaging CCTV programming being broadcast in Canada.

The petition was accompanied by the following two letters, which some individual complainants also re-sent on their own:

I'm writing to complain about a news story about Falun Gong (also known as Falun Dafa) that was being broadcasted on Sunday, December 16 on the Talentvision in Toronto during the 8:30 p.m.-9:00 p.m. news time.

The story about Falun Gong reflected the bias and ignorance of the reporter and the program producer. It portrayed Falun Gong practitioners to be mentally ill people. Its derogatory [*sic*] tone and remarks about Falun Gong made the audience become hostile towards the people that practise it.

Many Torontonians watched the program and were misinformed about Falun Gong because of the irresponsible behaviour of the Talentvision.

It was very evident that the 30-minute news reports are a reproduction of news from the CCTV Channel 4 of China. CCTV is a state-controlled network.

It is absolutely unacceptable to me to see CCTV 4 news being freely broadcasted [*sic*] in Canada, spreading lies and deceiving innocent Canadians.

Falun Gong is a spiritual practice that teaches one how to lives [*sic*] his/her life according to the universal principle Truthfulness-Compassion-Tolerance. The practice has gained much support from many countries around the world since 1992. In Canada in particular, more than 200 support letters and proclamations have been issued by all levels of government officials, NGOs and individuals.

It would be greatly appreciated if CRTC could look into the situation and request Talentvision to stop spreading lies and promoting hatred among Chinese Canadians. Talentvision ought to understand that it must abide by Canadian laws.

Your immediate attention in this matter is much appreciated.

Dear Sir/Madam,

We are writing to you out of serious concern regarding the fact that Chinese Central Television (CCTV), the official mouthpiece of the Chinese Communist Government, is now broadcasting and airing hate-inspiring propaganda on our Canadian airwaves. As Falun Gong practitioners here in Canada, we have been directly affected by this harmful programming. We would like to bring this inappropriate broadcasting to your attention and we hope that together with your help we can quickly resolve this matter and prevent such slanderous and hate-inspiring programmes from being aired in the future.

CCTV is a state-run programmer of the Chinese Government and has the mandate to promote the directives and views of the Chinese Communist Party. Included in these directives is the current brutal and widespread persecution and defamation of practitioners of Falun Gong, a peaceful spiritual practice that is enjoyed by millions in China and many here in Canada as well.

Live and unscreened satellite feeds of CCTV are now being passed directly from China onto Canadian cable television stations, carrying propaganda that is attacking, slandering and inspiring hate against those who practice Falun Gong.

On December 16, 2001, the newly licensed Chinese broadcast station Talentvision TV aired a segment of CCTV's "Chinese Satellite News" in which a news story exhibited graphic, brutal images of mutilated bodies covered in blood lying in a blood-soaked apartment. This news segment

looked much like a graphic horror film. The news announcer proceeded to claim that this act was committed by a Falun Gong practitioner. The accused “Falun Gong practitioner” then appeared in an interview, freely answering questions aimed at defaming Falun Gong. We would like to affirm that Falun Gong, its teachings and its practitioners are entirely peaceful and prohibit all forms of violence and killing. These broadcasts are damaging and hurtful to those good people who practice Falun Gong as they help to fuel the Chinese government’s persecution campaign in China. They have used their defamation claims to justify their harsh persecution.

We have provided an internet link so that you may view this footage yourself. The footage is broadcast in Mandarin Chinese and illustrates the brutal images.

rtsp://real.cctv.co
m.cn/newindex/videoonline/56K/1216jdftrm

[...]

Currently we are aware that:

- * CCTV’s “Chinese Satellite News” airs live daily on Talentvision (8:30AM - 9:00AM, 10:30AM - 11:00AM, and 8:30PM - 9:00PM) in Toronto (Roger’s cable channel 625), Vancouver and Ottawa

[...]

According to Article 5(1) of CRTC’s “Television Broadcasting Regulations, 1987:

A licensee shall not broadcast

- (a) anything in contravention of the law;
- (b) any abusive comment or abusive pictorial representation that, when taken in context, tends to or is likely to expose an individual or a group or class of individuals to hatred or contempt on the basis of race, national or ethnic origin, colour, religion, sex, sexual orientation, age or mental or physical disability;
- (c) any obscene or profane language or pictorial representation; or
- (d) any false or misleading news.

We feel that CCTV broadcasts clearly contravene (b), (c) and (d). In terms of the intention of this propaganda to inspire hate against innocent people because of their belief in Falun Gong, we also feel it is also in contradiction to (a). As a reference for this, ten days ago, on December 10, 2001, the Quebec Superior Court issued a Court Order to La Presses Chinoises [*sic*] newspaper in Montreal to immediately stop printing materials defamatory to Falun Gong. La Presses Chinoises [*sic*] had been printing, word-for-word, some of the official propaganda of the Chinese government.

The CRTC can play a great role in helping to preserve the rights of Canadian people by stopping the CCTV from airing in Canada. It can also help prevent this type of persecution through hate propaganda from entering into Canada and hurting more people. Preventing this propaganda from spreading and deceiving and influencing

more people, will also help those suffering under persecution in China. We have provided reference material for further information on the nature of this propaganda, the fallacies it is promoting, the damaging effects it has had and the precedents of legal action here in Canada which will help stop such hatred from being spread. We look forward to speaking with you soon and we thank you for your time and efforts to help uphold justice. Please note the below attachments that explain our circumstances and our concerns further.

Once the Falun Dafa Association was aware that the CBSC would be handling the complaint, it sent the following letter directly to the CBSC:

RE: Programs Inciting Hatred on [...] Talentvision TV

Several Falun Gong practitioners in Canada have written to CRTC on our concerns regarding the fact that Chinese Central Television (CCTV), the official mouthpiece of the Chinese Communist Government, is now broadcasting and airing hate-inspiring propaganda on our Canadian airwaves. Currently we are aware that:

- * CCTV's "Chinese Satellite News" airs live daily on Talentvision (8:30AM - 9:00AM, 10:30AM - 11:00AM, and 8:30PM - 9:00PM) in Toronto (Roger's cable channel 625), Vancouver and Ottawa

[...]

The CRTC is referring our complaints to CBSC. Some of the communication materials and supporting documents are copied for your reference.

To further support our complaints, we're submitting to you some background information on Falun Gong and China's persecution, as well as China's hate-inspiring propaganda in China and in Canada.

Also attached is a copy of over 1,200 petition signatures calling for an immediate end to this harmful and damaging CCTV programming being broadcast in Canada.

A list of the attached documents provided by the Association are as follows.

- Judgment of the Quebec Superior Court against La Presse Chinoise preventing it from publishing defamatory content against Falun Gong
- Press release entitled "A Second Canadian Judge Upholds Decision to Bar Publication of Anti-Falun Gong Material, January 7, 2002
- Letter from Rob Anders, MP for Calgary West congratulating Falun Dafa on their attempts to stop the incitement of hatred
- Letter from Rob Anders to John Manley, Minister of Foreign Affairs, concerning actions of Chinese Embassy against Falun Gong supporters, January 3, 2002
- "CSIS warned Ottawa of Beijing media plot," *Globe and Mail*, February 9, 2002.

- Duzhe, Mei. “How China’s Government is Attempting to Control Chinese Media in America,” *China Brief*, Vol. 1, Issue 10, November 21, 2001 (*China Brief* is a publication of the Jamestown Foundation, a private, non-profit organization.)
- Message from the Minister of Canadian Heritage, Sheila Copps, wishing practitioners a happy “Falun Dafa Week”
- Letter from Andy Wells, Mayor of St. John’s to the Chinese Ambassador to Canada criticizing China’s treatment of Falun Gong practitioners, August 3, 2001
- Article from International Education Development (a California-based human rights organization) outlining how China’s government has misrepresented Falun Gong
- Falun Dafa InfoCenter, “China’s State Media Uses Murder Case to Incite Hatred Against Falun Gong,” December 19, 2001.
- List of cases where Canadian Falun Gong practitioners were harassed and/or persecuted by Chinese officials
- Singer, Zev. “Falun Gong Banners Spark Bylaw Debate,” *Ottawa Citizen*, January 15, 2002
- Trepanier, Nathalie. “Embassy attack probed by cops,” *Ottawa Citizen*, January 2, 2002
- McElroy, Damien. “Beijing produces videos glorifying terrorist attacks on ‘arrogant’ US,” Telegraph Group Ltd., November 4, 2001
- Falun Gong Association, *The Story of Falun Gong: A powerful cultivation system of body, mind and spirit*, July 2000 (pamphlet)
- *Compassion: A Journal of Falun Dafa Around the World*, Issue 3, 2001 (magazine)
- *Forbearance: A Reader on Falun Gong and the Crisis in China*, Fall 2001 (newspaper)

II. Broadcaster Response

The President of Talentvision sent the following letter to all of the complainants:

RE: Dec 16th News Story Regarding Insane Killer in China
CBSC File # C01/02-415

We are writing in response to your letters/comments, which were forwarded to Talentvision by the Canadian Radio-television and Telecommunication Commission (“CRTC”) via the Canadian Broadcast Standards Council (“CBSC”).

These letters/comments convey your complaints and concerns about one particular news item, which was included in the Talentvision newscast, at 8:30pm, on December 16, 2001. This news item, produced by China Central TV (“CCTV”), reported on a multiple killing case in China, where the alleged murderer, shown as a middle-aged Chinese man, butchered his parents and his wife in their home; confessed to be a Falun Gong practitioner; and claimed his behaviour was part of his process in making his Falun Gong practice complete.

Your comments towards the coverage of the news story may be summarized as follows:

- 1) Since CCTV is controlled by the Chinese Government, it is largely a propaganda tool and as such its news production should not be aired in Canada;
- 2) The news footage contained graphic scenes including dead bodies and pools of blood that were inappropriate to air;
- 3) The reporting defamed the Falun Gong movement implying that it caused insanity and acts of violence; and
- 4) By airing this murder case, Talentvision has no compassion for, and helped promulgating hatred toward, Falun Gong members.

We regret that you were offended and/or extremely disturbed by this story, and that some of you even seemed to have interpreted the broadcast as Talentvision’s deliberate attempt to assist CCTV and the Chinese Government. Upon receipt of your complaints, we have reviewed objectively and carefully the appropriateness of airing the story, re-evaluating our decision in light of your concerns. We would like to address each of the above concerns with the following response:

- 1) Talentvision primarily serves Mandarin-speaking Chinese Canadians and in its mandate provides news that is of interest to its viewers. This includes Canadian news, world news and news from the homelands of many viewers, namely Mainland China and Taiwan. We make use of the best news sources available; for news from Mainland China and Taiwan this includes organizations based in these countries. Being State-owned does not disqualify CCTV from being a legitimate news source. However, Talentvision is sensitive to the programming that is aired in Canada and where appropriate, not all items available from foreign sources are broadcast on our station.
- 2) The story reported on a heinous and violent act. While graphic details were televised of the bloodied scene, no picture of the bodies was aired contrary to comments made by some viewers. A warning of the graphic nature of any type of potentially disturbing upcoming footage would be well-advised in the future.
- 3) In our view, the story reported that the alleged killer was insane, and in his insanity, had formed some warped rationale for the murders, which involved his notions of Falun Gong. We did not believe our viewers would infer that practising Falun Gong would lead to insanity and acts of violence. Canadians are familiar with Falun Gong, thanks in part to the media attention Talentvision and other western media companies have given Falun Gong in educating the public on its values and beliefs. We can assure you that Talentvision was by no means attempting to criticize or evaluate Falun Gong and Falun Dafa’s followers.
- 4) Talentvision has had a long history of adhering very closely to the regulations set for Canadian broadcasters and uses every effort in maintaining a fair, neutral and balanced position in

our news broadcasts. We have, since the inception of Falun Gong, provided our audience with many opportunities to gain a better understanding of the various views, issues and angles related to the practice. Consequently, there was no reason for us to believe that the December 16 news report, where the insanity rather than the practice of Falun Gong was the overriding characteristic of the alleged criminal, would inspire hatred of Falun Gong practitioners.

The material's source was clearly stated as CCTV and any skepticism regarding the authenticity of the murders, alleged murderer and his involvement in practicing Falun Gong are subject to the credibility of this source. Talentvision will not knowingly act as a propaganda agent for anyone and believes very strongly in human rights and the freedom of the press. In allowing our audience this view into China via CCTV and given Falun Gong's status in China, perhaps it would have been prudent before/after the segment aired for our news announcer to have reminded our viewers of the source of this program and the differing status of Falun Gong in both countries.

We sincerely thank all of you for providing us with this feedback and emphasizing how powerful a role media can play in shaping perceptions about Falun Gong. We apologize for any anguish this may have caused beyond the tragic nature of the loss of life reported; we will keep your comments in mind should a similar situation present itself in the future.

As a licensee of the CRTC, we are highly aware of our responsibilities pursuant to the Broadcasting Act for all of the programs we broadcast. We hope that our response satisfactorily addresses your complaints. In the event that you wish to discuss this matter further, I can be reached at xxx-xxx-xxxx.

III. Additional Correspondence

Some of the complainants wrote a second time to the CBSC and/or to Talentvision in response to Talentvision's letter. The response letter from the Association, on which they copied the CBSC, is as follows:

RE: 16th News Story Regarding Insane Killer in China CBSC File C01/02-416

I'd like to thank you for your letter dated January 31, 2002.

I am sorry to inform you that we are not satisfied with your response. In your letter you made an effort to summarize our complaint into 5 points. I felt our complaint can simply be summarized in the following:

Since China started to crack down on Falun Gong in July 1999, CCTV has never shown anything but severely distorted views of Falun Gong. The role CCTV has been playing on this matter is to spread orchestrated lies about Falun Gong to demonize this innocent group and justify the Chinese authority's persecution. CCTV's news regarding Falun Gong is false and misleading. These news [*sic*] incites hate and should not be aired in Canada.

Falun Gong is a practice of mind, body and spirit based on the universal principle of Truth-Compassion-Forbearance. When Falun Gong was introduced in China in 1992 and in the first few years, Falun Gong was welcomed and praised by the Chinese authority for its effect of improving people's health and moral quality. However as Falun Gong became more and more popular and the number of people practicing Falun Gong out-numbered the Communist party members, the president of China started to crackdown [*sic*] on the Falun Gong and in order to justify his

persecution, started to utilize the state-run propaganda machine such as CCTV to demonize Falun Gong.

I have attached to this letter two video tapes:

Video Tape 1 - "Self-Immolation" – A Staged Tragedy? (in English)

It is the slowed down version of CCTV's repeatedly broadcast [*sic*] of alleged Falun Gong practitioners having self-immolation [*sic*] in Tiananmen Square. This example shows to what extent the Chinese authority has went [*sic*] in order to demonize this group.

Video Tape 2 - Truth behind CCTV reports on Fu's murder (in Chinese)

Present the Truth about this particular news item aired on Talentvision 8:30pm on December 16, 2001.

I would like to quote comments regarding this issue by Amnesty International in their March 23, 2000 document: **"The crackdown on Falun Gong and other so-called 'heretical organizations'":**

The government's accusations against Falun Gong followers range from "organizing illegal gatherings" to "threatening political stability". These accusations include "forcefully occupying parks", organising or taking part in "illegal" sit-ins, assemblies or demonstrations, obstructing "normal religious activities", having "illegally" published and distributed books, "leaking state secrets", "harming people's health" or "causing deaths" through the philosophy it promoted.

This latter accusation in particular has been used widely by the government to justify its crackdown on the group. According to information published by the government, (7) Falun Gong 'caused over 1400 deaths', most of which concerned people who died from illnesses allegedly because they refused medical treatment due to their Falun Gong beliefs. In the current climate of censorship and repression in China, this allegation cannot be independently verified. In view of the government's political crackdown and massive propaganda campaign against Falun Gong, the impartiality of the government's information is questionable. Furthermore, the information published by the government leaves many essential questions unanswered. It fails for example to demonstrate any direct connection between the alleged deaths and Falun Gong leaders or organisers. Under international law, criminal responsibility is determined case by case, on an individual basis. In the case of leaders or local organisers of Falun Gong who have been prosecuted on charges of "causing deaths", the government has not presented evidence of a direct link between the alleged deaths and the defendants. Nor has the government presented evidence that the defendants had full knowledge that the philosophy they were promoting might cause deaths. Evidence of this direct link and of "knowledge" is essential to determine criminal responsibility, but such evidence is lacking in these cases.

Furthermore, the government published this and other accusations as 'facts' before leading members of Falun Gong were prosecuted. In the context of the political crackdown on the movement, it instituted a presumption of guilt against those to be prosecuted. The official documents issued for the crackdown in themselves show that the judicial process was biased from the outset against the defendants. This violates international standards in several respects, notably the right of detainees to be presumed innocent until proven guilty through a fair and

open trial by an independent tribunal. This also goes against new provisions introduced in Chinese law in 1996 to make the judicial process fairer.

I would also quote comments by International Education Development made in August 2001 during the United Nations Sub-Commission on the Promotion and Protection of Human Rights Fifty-third session, Agenda item 6:

“In our statement under item 3 we described the Falun Gong Practice as we have found it to be. The government, in exercise of the right to reply, attempted to justify its State terrorism against the group by calling it an “evil cult” that has caused deaths and the break-up of families. In our investigation, the only deaths have been at the hands of the Chinese authorities; families have been broken up because family members have been killed by the regime; people have been broken down, not by Falun Gong, but by extreme torture, incarceration in mental hospitals with brutal treatment, hard labour in labour camps and other such practices. As was reported in the International Herald Tribune on August 6, 2001, the regime admits that it has officially sanctioned violence against practitioners in order to wipe out Falun Gong. The regime points to a supposed self-immolation incident in Tiananmen Square on January 23, 2001 as proof that Falun Gong is an “evil cult”. However, we have obtained a video of that incident that in our view proves that this event was staged by the government. We have copies of that video available for distribution.”

The teaching of Falun Gong forbids killing, including suicide. Please find attached to this letter, section “The Issue of Killing” in Chapter 7 of Zhuan Falun, the main book that expounded the teaching of Falun Gong, where Mr. Li, Hongzhi stressed time and again that practitioners of Falun Gong cannot kill lives [sic].

Attached to this letter, please also find comments and analysis about Fu Yibin’s killing case. I would like to quote Dr. Vivianna Galli’s comments: *“It is unfortunate that the Chinese government resorts to twisting sad cases of severe mental illness into the propaganda aimed at defaming Falun Gong. Relating Falun Gong to this case is absurd.”*

For your information, I have also attached comments from University professor [sic] and other credible third parties regarding the issue of Falun Gong:

1. “Falungong and Canada’s China policy”, by David Ownby, Associate Professor of History, University of Montreal
2. Section “The issue of Killing” in Chapter 7 of Zhuan Falun, the main book that expounded the teaching of Falun Gong by Mr. Li Hongzhi, founder of Falun Gong.
3. Comments and Analysis: CCTV International News Reporter Comments on the Fu Yibin Murder case.
4. Selected Reports on China’s Persecution of Falun Gong
5. Frequently asked questions about Falun Gong.
6. Terrorism and human rights (Except [sic]), United Nations documents.
7. Comments made by Member of Parliament of Canada regarding Falun Gong

We believe it is the media’s responsibility to present the truth, to provide a healthy view of the world, to promote just [sic] and suppress the evil. Airing Chinese

communist regime's propaganda to defame a righteous practice and help extending their crackdown to Canada is something no responsible media would like to continue to do.

The following documents were attached to that letter:

- Frequently Asked Questions About Falun Gong
- Ownby, David. "Falungong and Canada's China policy," *International Journal*, Spring 2001, pp. 183-204. (Ownby is an Associate Professor of History and Director of East Asian Studies at the Université de Montréal.)
- Li, Hongzhi. "The Issue of Killing," Ch. 7 of *Zhuan Falun* (English Version)
- Hansard Number 048, 37th Parliament, 1st Session, April 25, 2001 in which the MPs discuss China's human rights issues
- "Terrorism and human rights (Excerpt)," Progress report prepared by Ms. Kalliopi K. Koufa, United Nations Commission on Human Rights, June 27, 2001
- Yimei, Zhao (alias). "Visiting CCTV International News Reporter Comments on the Fu Yibin Murder Case," December 27, 2001
- "'Capital Murder Case's' Fu Yibin Was Insane According to Relative, February 2, 2002
- Galli, Vivianna, MD. "An American Psychiatrist's Comments: The Fu Yibin Case is a Psychiatric Case."
- Falun Dafa Association. "Chinese Officials Use Violent Crimes to Escalate Propaganda Campaign Against Falun Gong," January 3, 2002
- "A Psychiatry Professor Talks about the Case of Psychotic Killer Fu Yibin," January 1, 2002
- International Education Development's Statement on self-immolation, August 2001
- News Release, "Quebec Superior Court Expands Order to Strictly Stop Defaming Falun Gong, February 8, 2002
- Quebec Superior Court Judgment against *La Presse Chinoise*, December 10, 2001
- Amnesty International Report, "Torture - A Growing Scourge in China (excerpt)," December 2, 2001

- Amnesty International Report, “The crackdown on Falun Gong and other so-called ‘heretical organizations’,” March 23, 2000
- Amnesty International Report, “China: Falun Gong deaths in custody continue to rise as crackdown worsens,” December 19, 2000
- Amnesty International Annual Report, “China (Excerpt),” 2000
- Amnesty International News Release, “China: Human rights and the spirit of Olympism,” July 13, 2001
- Amnesty International Briefing, “People’s Republic of China: Human Rights in China in 2001 - A New Step Backwards,” September 3, 2001
- List of links to other Amnesty International articles
- World Psychiatric Association, News from the Secretariat, WPA-APA Leadership Meeting, 2 Quarter, 2001, concerning the alleged abuse of psychiatry in China to persecute Falun Gong practitioners
- Royal College of Psychiatrists, “Resolution passed to investigate political abuse in China,” Annual Meeting, July 2001
- American Psychiatric Association, “Final Action Paper: Condemning the Chinese Government’s Misuse of Psychiatry,” May 2001
- Lehmann, Christine. “Visitors Describe Advances In China’s Psychiatric System,” *Psychiatric News*, June 16, 2000
- Munro, Robin. “Judicial Psychiatry in China and Its Political Abuses,” *The Journal of Asian Law*
- “Contortions of Psychiatry in China,” *New York Times*, March 25, 2001
- Information Center for Human Rights and Democracy (Hong Kong-based organization that provides info about human rights in China), “China Is Intensifying Its Crackdown on Religions and Spiritual Movements Using the ‘Law Against Cults’,” March 16, 2000
- Commission on Human Rights, “The Situation in China,” *Question of the Violation of Human Rights and Fundamental Freedoms in Any Part of the World*, Fifty-eighth session, Item 9 of the provisional agenda

- Consultations between the Department of Foreign Affairs and International Trade And Canadian Human Rights Non-Governmental Organizations, Written Statements Submitted to the 57th Session United Nations Commission on Human Rights
- *The Bilateral Human Rights Dialogue with China: Undermining the International Human Rights Regime*
- Press Release, “The Royal College of Psychiatrists in the U.K. Pass Resolution to Investigate Psychiatric Abuse in China.”
- United Nations Commission on Human Rights, “China,” *Report of the Special Rapporteur on Violence against Women*, February 13, 2001
- United Nations Commission on Human Rights, “China,” *Civil and Political Rights Including the Questions of Torture and Detention*, January 25, 2001
- United Nations Commission on Human Rights, “Deaths in custody,” *Civil and Political Rights, Including the Question of Disappearances and Summary Executions*, January 11, 2001
- Press Release, “Freedom House to Censure China and Cuba at UN Human Rights Commission,” March 28, 2000
- International Centre for Human Rights and Democratic Development, News Release, “Falun Gong Persecution Must Stop,” July 29, 1999
- International Centre for Human Rights and Democratic Development, News Release, “Message of Support to The Falun Gong Movement,” August 17, 2000
- Writers in Prison Committee, “PEN Canada Honorary Member List,” January 10, 2002
- World Organisation Against Torture, “OMCT intervenes at the CHR on torture: Bahrain, Tunisia, Libya, China and the need for additional international mechanisms,” April 2001