
APPENDIX A

CBSC Decision 08/09-0196 CJCH-TV (CTV Atlantic) re CTV News at 6 (Stéphane Dion interview)

CTV Atlantic (CJCH-TV) broadcast the interview between CTV journalist Steve Murphy and federal Liberal leader Stéphane Dion during its 6:00 pm newscast on October 9, 2008. The segment began at 6:37 pm. Steve Murphy is also the anchorman for that newscast, so he introduced the piece.

Murphy: Someone once said that in politics a week is a lifetime. Well it's now several weeks since we last spoke with Stéphane Dion and a great many things have changed. The world markets are now in turmoil, interest rates and the dollar are falling and the Liberal Party has seen its popularity rise in the polls after the two leaders debates. Against that backdrop, we sat down this afternoon with Stéphane Dion. I began by asking Mr. Dion about his comments that the prime minister has done nothing to put Canadians' minds at ease about the current economic problems. I asked him, quote, "If you were prime minister now, what would you have done that Mr. Harper has not done?" After beginning to answer that question, Monsieur Dion asked to start the interview again because he did not understand the question. After a second false start, a member of Monsieur Dion's staff explained the question to Monsieur Dion and there was also a third false start. Perhaps we shouldn't have agreed to restart with the questioning and the Liberal campaign was anxious that this exchange not be broadcast and initially we indicated that it would not be. However, on reflection, CTV News believes we owe it to you to show you everything that happened.

Clip of Interview: Head shot of Dion; only Murphy's voice is heard from off-camera

Murphy: Thank you. Monsieur Dion, thank you. Good of you to come again.

Dion: Thank you, Steve.

Murphy: Monsieur Dion, the economy is now the issue in the campaign and on that issue you've said that, today, that Mr. Harper's offered nothing to put Canadians' minds at ease and offers no vision for the country. We have to act now, you say. Doing nothing is not an option. If you were prime minister now, what would you have done about the economy and this crisis that Mr. Harper has not done?

Dion: If I would have been prime minister two and a half years ago?

Murphy: If you were the prime minister right now.

Dion: Right now?

Murphy: And had been for the last two years.

Dion: Okay, no. If I'm elected next Tuesday, this Tuesday, is what you are suggesting?

Murphy: No, I, I'm saying if you, hypothetically, were prime minister today.

Dion: Today.

Murphy: What would you have done that Mr. Harper has not done?

Dion: I would start the 30/50 plan that we want to start the moment that we'll have a, a Liberal Government. And the 30/50 plan, uh, the 30, in fact, the plan for the first 30 days, I should say, the plan for the first 30 days once you have a Liberal Government. Can we start again?

Murphy: Do you want to?

male voice off-camera: Sure.

Dion: [looks at someone off-camera] Yeah?

Murphy: I'm okay to start again.

Dion: Yeah. Because I think I been [sic] slow to understand your question.

male voice: I'm recording.

Dion: Okay.

Murphy: Monsieur Dion, good of you to come again.

Dion: Thank you, Steve.

Murphy: Monsieur Dion, you've said today that Mr. Harper has offered, uh, nothing to put Canadians' minds at ease during this financial crisis and you go on to say that he has no vision for the country. You say we have to act now. Doing nothing is not an option. So I'd like to begin by asking you if you were prime minister now, what would you have already done in this crisis that Mr. Harper hasn't done?

Dion: I can't, I don't understand the question. Because, are you asking me to be prime minister at, at which moment? Today or since a week or since two weeks or since –

Murphy: No. If you, if you were prime minister during this time already.

Dion: [visibly frustrated] We need to start again. I'm sorry. If I was the prime minister starting when? Today? If I was the prime minister today?

female voice off-camera: If you were the prime minister when, since Harper's been prime minister.

Dion: But, yes, two years and a half ago.

female: At any given time.

Dion: Two years. Two years and a half ago.

female: What would you have done differently between, between the time that Harper's been there to change things.

Dion: Yeah, but if I have been prime minister two years and a half ago, would [sic] have had an agenda. Let's start again.

Murphy:Okay.

[female off-camera laughs]

Dion: We'll go there.

male voice off-camera: I'm still recording.

Murphy:Monsieur Dion, thank you for coming.

Dion: Thank you, Steve. Let's start again, I'm [laughs].

[female off-camera laughs]

Murphy:It's a good job [sic] that tape is cheap.

Dion: But, but give me, give me a first date where I'm prime minister that I can figure out what, what is your question is about [sic].

End of interview clip.

Murphy at anchor desk: Here then is the interview in its entirety from the point that we pick it up now, which is the re-ask of the question.

CTV then broadcast the final and "good" take of the interview in which Dion discussed his platform and suggestions for dealing with the economic crisis.

Murphy:Monsieur Dion, thank you for coming.

Dion: Thank you, Steve.

Murphy:The economy is now the major issue that we're confronting in this campaign and on that issue you've said that Mister Harper has offered nothing to put Canadians' minds at ease and offers no vision for this country. You say we have to act now, that doing nothing is not an option. I'd like to ask you, Mister Dion, if you were Prime Minister of Canada today, what would you have done by now that Stephen Harper has not done about this economic crisis?

Dion: A-, Assume that I have been elected today prime minister, the first thing I would do is to consult with the Privy Council Office, minister of Finance, to know exactly which situation we are according, uh, the data. I would speed up the, uh, my ability to appoint rapidly a government with the minister of Finance to, to be able to be prime minister right away, as soon as possible. And once we are the Government, uh, we have thirty days of an action plan that we announce. So we will need to work with the regulatory agencies to have their best recommendations to protect our savings, to protect our mortgages, our pensions and our jobs. I will, uh, I will speed up the investment in infrastructure and in the manufacturing sectors to create economic activity and jobs now. Good jobs, well-paid jobs.

Murphy:Mm hm.

Dion: I, I will, uh, call, uh, Mini-, uh, First Ministers meeting to be sure that our great federation, everybody will work in coordination: provinces, territories and the federal government. I will consult the best economists of the private sector.

Murphy:Mm hm.

Dion: To ask them where are we ready, uh, uh, really? Us, Canada, and the world. What is, what is their forecast for the situation in which we are? There are a lot of things that I would do. I would not be passive as Mister Harper.

Murphy:But looking back over the past two weeks, what specifically should Mr. Harper have done about this economic crisis that he has not done?

Dion: He did nothing. And what I will need to do is to be sure that the regulatory agencies will come with their best recommendations. There are things to examine. For instance, can we improve the, uh, insurance on the deposits of Canadians? That's what other countries have done. Can we put our seniors in a situation where they are not in the obligation, uh, to sell their savings when the, uh, when, when the, uh, stock market is so shaky? There are a lot of things that other countries are doing and here in Canada Mr. Harper is doing nothing.

Murphy:You've also said that Mr. Harper should say something to ease the minds of Canadians. What would you say to ease the minds of Canadians now? People who are worried about their RRSPs, their pensions, their homes?

Dion: Exactly. But when I say so at, uh, during the debate, in English and in French, he accused me, and, and other people like me to panic. And he said everything is fine. Everything was not fine. You need to share the pain, to share, share the, the anxiety of the people. And you need to be a prime minister who shows that he cares.

Murphy:But how would you show that right now? What could you say right now?

Dion: I think Canadians are –

Murphy:As leader of the Liberal Party?

Dion: I think Canadians have understood that I care. And understood that, uh, I want to do the right thing. And that I want to tap on the, on the great, uh, tradition of the Liberal Party. Uh, in 1993, Mr. Chrétien cared. And there was a deficit of 42 billion dollars. The Reform Party, the party of Mr. Harper, uh, was saying slash and cut everything. Mister Chrétien said "No, I will protect the social fabric of Canada, but I will put the fiscal house in order." He did it with Mr. Martin and other Liberals. It's what we need to do now.

Murphy:One of the things that other countries, other leaders have done is address their nation. Stand up behind a podium and deliver a message to the people of their country about the economic state of the country. If you were given that chance, to stand behind the podium to address the people of the country, in this role or in the role of prime minister of Canada, what would you say to Canadians?

Dion: I would, I would say what I have said as the Leader of the Opposition and as a Canadian who wants to become the prime minister of this country to help the people in tough difficulty.

Murphy:Mm hm.

Dion: I would have said exactly what I have said: I have a plan. And this plan will make sure that your government will be there to help. I will not pretend that everything is okay and you may, it's a good time to buy and this kind of thing that Mr. Harper's said in showing that he's insensitive and disconnected with the reality, out of touch with the reality where Canadians are. But in addition to it, I will say in the next 30 days I will implement this plan. In the next 30 days, I will come with policies that we need, will come with the fiscal, uh, economic and fiscal update, which is kind of mini-budget.

Murphy: Can we wait 30 days, though, Mr. Dion?

Dion: Uh, well, uh, well, I will not wait 30 days. We'll have action during these 30 days. It's a plan to be implemented during the first 30 days of a Liberal Government.

Murphy: Today Mister Harper gave you a promotion of a sort when he said that if you elect prime minister Dion who will impose and raise carbon taxes and run deficits, interest rates will go up. Why, why would you suspect that interest rates wouldn't go up if in fact we had that sort of [??].

Dion: This man is lying to Canadians since the beginning about this plan, the Liberal plan. I say that face to face to him during the debate. Because, it's not true. You have 250 economists who wrote the letter a couple of days ago –

Murphy: Mm hm.

Dion: -- saying, uh, that they were endorsing the principle of a green shift. That means what? Cut taxes what is creating growth in Canada, cut the taxes on what is creating the strong economy. That means your income, your savings, your investments and your pensions and also your profits if you're in business. And instead of that, put the price on pollution. These economists, they know what they are talking about. In fact the countries that have done that green shift already are resisting better than the ones that are, that didn't. They are outperforming the economy of the countries that didn't do their green shift. I want Canada to succeed. The green shift is a way to have a stronger economy. It's good for your wallet and it's good for the planet. And I invite, Steve, everybody to see the lie of Mister Harper. You just have to go the green shift dot C A, there is a calculator and it will give you the amount of tax cuts you will enjoy the fourth year of the Liberal plan if we have a Liberal Government. For a family earning 60 thousand dollars with two kids, it's a tax cut of 13 hundred dollars. Mr. Harper doesn't want you to know that.

Murphy: Monsieur Dion, using the formula, the premier of Nova Scotia says that the people of Nova Scotia will net lose one hundred and thirty million dollars a year.

Dion: Nobody have clue about how he comes with this number.

Murphy: Well, he says he's using 2005 emission numbers and your formula.

Dion: Yeah, except that we don't tax well-heads, we tax at the wholesale level. So his calculation is, is not appropriate. I'm sure Mr. Bryson will explain that.

Murphy: There's no loss?

Dion: What, what I want to say to Nova Scotians: I love my country. If I propose this strategy for Canada, it's because I know that it will be good for all Canadians and all provinces. It's worked in other countries. Sweden had done that years ago and their economy is growing faster than ours. N-, Norway has a, a carbon tax much bigger than the

one we are proposing and they are, have a strong economy. Switzerland did it, uh, a lot of countries. U.K., in U.K., Mr. David Cameron, who is the Conservative leader who wants to become prime minister, is campaigning and saying "I want more green taxes, as long as there are replacement taxes that means tax cuts for all U.K. families." It sounds familiar, no?

It's not a right-wing or a left-wing policy. It's the right thing to do. That to have a fiscal framework that is adapted to the challenges of the 21st century. I want Canada to succeed in the 21st century. For that, we need to cut taxes on what we like and to put a price on pollution.

Murphy: Monsieur Dion –

Dion: And what we like, it's our income.

Murphy: A couple of quick things before we go. And I know you must leave. You have been very strident in saying there will be no deficit under a Liberal Government in this country. How can you be sure, given the uncertain economic situation in the world, that there will not be a need to run a deficit, even temporarily?

Dion: We will not cause a deficit. I was at the Cabinet table when we had to, uh, put our fiscal house in order with Mr. Martin and Mr. Chrétien. It has been a very painful exercise. We learned, uh, that, uh, it's very important to not try to solve your problems of today with the money of your children and grandchildren. So we'll not cause it.

Murphy: Under any circumstances?

Dion: We'll not cause a deficit.

Murphy: We learned today from an officer of Parliament that the war in Afghanistan will cost something on the order of 18.1 billion to prosecute by 2011. We also know the tremendous cost in the lives of Canadians. With the full benefit of hindsight, Monsieur Dion, what should we have done about Afghanistan in the beginning?

Dion: Oh, many things. How long do we have? I want first to pay tribute to our brave men and women in uniform and our civilians who are, uh, risking their lives for the people of Afghanistan. What we need to do is to have a prime minister that will be trustworthy, reliable. Mr. Harper said something and its contrary. He said we'll stay as long as the job is not done. Whatever that means. And he say, and he said we'll leave in 2009. So Mr. Ignatieff and I went in Afghanistan at the beginning of this year. And we realized that our allies and the government of Afghanistan were believing the other story, uh, that means we'll stay as long as the job is not job. They did not believe at all about the end date of 2009. And nothing was ready for us to leave. And you cannot leave Afghanistan like you leave a camping, because you have lives, human, human beings' lives, other responsibilities. So we decided to extend the missions two year more with the clear end date 2011. And this time, if I am the prime minister, first thing we'll do, I will say to our allies this end date of 2011 is a serious one. We'll do our best to help the people of Afghanistan in the meanwhile, but after that Canada will accept other missions elsewhere in the world.

Murphy: Was it –

Dion: This will be clear, it will be the end of the hypocrisy of Stephen Harper who said something and its contrary.

Murphy: Finally though, was it a mistake to begin this mission, with the benefit of hindsight?

Dion: No. What has been a mistake, though, is what, we were supposed to end the Khandahar mission in 2007. Mr. Harper decided to extend this by two years until 2009. Without negotiating anything. It's only this year, 2008, with the report of, uh, John Manley, that Mr. Harper admitted that we were lacking the tools that we need. There were not enough troops, there were not enough weapons. Why did not negotiate that in 2007 before, uh, asking for an extension, deciding for an extension. He should have said to NATO "I'm ready to stay two years more unless, only, only if you give me more troops and more, uh, more weapons." He did not do so and for that he failed as a prime minister. He failed our troops, he failed Canadians, he failed Afghanistan. He wanted to be macho, go alone without negotiating anything. It was a mistake. I will not do that. I will be realistic, I will be trustworthy. Our allies will know what I commit when I commit. After a strong negotiation with our allies to know what will be their own contribution to be sure that Canadians will have a fair burden on their shoulders when we accept a dangerous mission.

Murphy: So the mistake was staying, not going?

Dion: The mission was to stay without to have negotiated at the outset the help of our allies to be sure that our troops would work in acceptable conditions.

Murphy: Monsieur Dion, thank you again for your time.

Dion: Thank you, Steve, thank you so much. And happy Thanksgiving to all Canadians. And your students will be back, students will be back in their families, so discuss politics with them. Tuesday's an important choice.

[end of interview]

Murphy [at anchor desk]: The leader of the Liberals, Stéphane Dion. For the record, the interviews you see on this broadcast are usually live and those which are recorded are not edited for content. We believe you have the right to see the entire exchange, the questions and the answers. We don't want to be accused of hiding anything and that is why we opted to show you tonight's entire exchange. And this interview today fulfilled our invitation to have the leaders appear twice on this broadcast. Monsieur Dion is the only leader to take us up on that. The prime minister, who has not appeared, has been invited to join us tomorrow.