
APPENDIX B

CBSC Decision 12/13-0069 Sun News Network re *The Source* (Theft Ring)

The Complaints

The CBSC received a total of 38 complaints about this broadcast. Of those, only 12 complainants were provided the opportunity to request a ruling (the others either did not actually see the original broadcast themselves or did not provide detailed enough information about the broadcast). Of the 12 people who could request a ruling, three complainants did so. Their complaints are reproduced below.

File 12/13-0069

The following complaint was submitted via email on September 11, 2012:

Dear CRTC/CBSC:

Please find attached a formal complaint we are filing against a recently aired segment of *The Source with Ezra Levant* on the Sun News Network (episode airing September 5 at 5 pm). We believe the deeply offensive segment in question, entitled "The Jew vs. The Gypsies," violates the *CAB Code of Ethics*, the *CAB's Equitable Portrayal Code*, the *CAB Violence Code* and the *RTDNA's Code of Ethics*. Please find attached a full briefing detailing the offensive passages and the segments of the aforementioned codes we believe were violated.

Sincerely,

Roma Community Center Board of Directors

The following letter was attached to that email:

Dear CRTC/CBSC:

We are writing to you on behalf of the Roma Community Center (RCC) to file a formal complaint against Ezra Levant, host of *The Source with Ezra Levant* on the Sun News Network. The RCC is concerned about a series of derogatory, hate-filled and racist remarks targeting the Roma community that were made by Levant on a recent episode of his show. The segment in question, "The Jew vs. The Gypsies" (itself an offensive title given the shared history of suffering uniting the Jewish and Roma communities), aired on Wednesday, September 5 at 5 pm Eastern Time (a link to the full 8 min 42 sec segment can be found here: <http://www.sunnewsnetwork.ca/sunnews/canada/archives/2012/09/20120905-203437.html>).

We believe that the comments made by Levant violate the *CAB Code of Ethics*, the CAB's *Equitable Portrayal Code*, the *CAB Violence Code* and the RTDNA's *Code of Ethics*. In this segment, Levant perpetuates some of the most offensive and long-standing racial stereotypes targeting Roma. These include associating all Roma with criminality, thieving, nomadism, and gangs, as well as denying our identity as a diasporic population with common origins in India (including shared language, culture and traditions), not to mention calling our entire community a 'scourge' upon Canadian society. These negative racial stereotypes are deeply injurious and offensive to the Roma community.

Levant's stereotyping of Roma is further reinforced by images and on-screen text that accompany the segment. During his monologue, alleging an inherent association between criminality and Roma, a number of images of ordinary Roma are shown. These images include Roma children playing music, Roma cultural manifestations, and scenes of everyday life in the Roma community. There is nothing to suggest that these stock images of Roma have anything to do with crime, yet throughout the segment this is the inference viewers are led to draw. The images are reinforced by accompanying onscreen text that reads: 'Gypsy Crime in Canada' (it is worth noting that the racist term 'Gypsy Crime' is commonly used by neo-fascist circles in Europe); 'We've Been Gypped'; and, 'Tramps and Thieves: Cher Got it Right' (in reference to the 1971 song/album 'Gypsies [sic], Tramps and Thieves' by singer/songwriter Cher).

In fact, Levant's comments in this segment go beyond merely negatively stereotyping Roma, extending to the denial of our very existence as a minority community, denigrating the use of proper naming practices for Roma people and deploying racial slurs like 'Gypsy' and 'gypped' to target us collectively in the media. Levant uses such hate speech to then call for the mass rounding up and deportation of our community and for increasing state intervention into our lives. Levant thus ends up advocating state-directed violence against Canada's Roma community as a whole, bringing back worrying memories of the long history of state-directed persecution against the Roma community, including the legacy of the *Porajmos* (the Nazi Holocaust targeting Roma during WWII in which up to 1.5-million Roma perished). We have selected **10 offending passages** [sic, actually 11, but they misnumbered the statements] made by Levant and have identified the sections of the relevant codes we believe were violated as a result. We are confident that the CRTC, CBSC and Sun News Network will treat these comments with the gravity they deserve.

Sincerely,

Roma Community Center Board of Directors

STATEMENT #1 BY LEVANT

"These are Gypsies, a culture synonymous with swindlers. The phrase Gypsy and cheater have been so interchangeable historically that the word has entered the English language as a verb. He gypped me! Well the gypsies have gypped us too." (00:25-00:37)

Instead of using the internationally accepted term 'Roma' for our community, Levant uses the racial slur 'Gypsy' and 'gypped' throughout the segment. Levant does little to inform the viewing public about Roma history, instead deliberately misinforming Canadians about our past, culture and traditions. The suggestion that 'swindling' and 'cheating' are synonymous with being a 'Gypsy' is deeply offensive and racist.

The RCC believes the above statement by Levant to be in violation of:

The following provisions of the *CAB Code of Ethics*:

Clause 2 – Human Rights

Clause 6 – Full, Fair and Proper Representation

The following provisions of the *CAB Equitable Portrayal Code*:

(1) Equitable Portrayal

(2) Human Rights

(3) Negative Portrayal

(4) Stereotyping

(5) Stigmatization and Victimization

(7) Degrading Material

(9) Language and Terminology

The following provisions of the *RTDNA Code of Ethics*:

Article One – Accuracy

Article Two – Equality

Article Nine – Fair Trial

STATEMENT #2 BY LEVANT

"And they [Roma] come here to gyp us again, to rob us blind, as they have done in Europe for centuries." (00:40-00:45)

Here, again, Levant is suggesting an inherent link between being Roma and criminality. Furthermore, 'as they have done for centuries' strongly suggests that criminality is an unchanging and essential feature of the Roma community throughout its history. A more informed analysis would associate the 'centuries old' stereotype linking Roma to criminality as the basis for repeated waves of state-directed discrimination, segregation

and genocide targeting our community. It is worth recalling that the alleged link between the Roma and crime was the basis for racist legislation in Nazi Germany used to first marginalize and then, eventually, exterminate our community. Nazi laws specifically targeting the Roma included: the 1935 Nuremberg Laws that defined Roma as non-Aryan (and hence second-class citizens); the 1937 Law Against Crime that defined Roma as 'asocial'; the 1938 creation of an SS 'Central Office for Fighting the Gypsy Menace'; the mass rounding-up and detention of Roma that began in 1939; the 1941 expulsion of remaining Roma children from German schools; the 1942 order to deport Roma to Auschwitz; and the 1944 decision by Himmler ordering the extermination of Europe's Roma community. In the present day, right-wing extremists and neo-fascist organizations in Europe, and increasingly in North America, use the neologism 'Gypsy Crime' to perpetuate such racist agendas. The ongoing abuse of the human rights of Roma people by right-wing extremist organizations, but also by some governments in Europe in recent years, is well-documented by Amnesty International, Human Rights Watch, as well as EU and UN human rights bodies. The fact that Levant openly engages in racist rhetoric and stereotypes, without acknowledging their history, is deeply disturbing.

The RCC believes the above statement by Levant to be in violation of:

The following provisions of the *CAB Code of Ethics*:

Clause 2 – Human Rights

Clause 6 – Full, Fair and Proper Presentation

The following provisions of the *CAB Equitable Portrayal Code*:

(1) Equitable Portrayal

(2) Human Rights

(3) Negative Portrayal

(4) Stereotyping

(5) Stigmatization and Victimization

(7) Degrading Material

(9) Language and Terminology

The following provisions of the *RTDNA Code of Ethics*:

Article One – Accuracy

Article Two – Equality

Article Nine – Fair Trial

STATEMENT #3 BY LEVANT

"Let me stop before you start blowing your hate crime whistle at me for saying 'Gypsy' or 'gyped'. See, political correctness and euphemisms like calling them 'Roma' instead of Gypsy or as the BBC calls them 'Travelers,' well the point of that is to obscure the truth. They're Gypsies and one of the central characteristics of that culture is that their chief economy is theft and begging. Sorry, it's true!" (00:58-01:19)

Here Levant explicitly admits that he is aware that his speech may constitute a hate crime. Nevertheless, he proceeds to engage in extremely crude ethnic stereotyping by stating that: "one of the central characteristics of [Roma] culture is that their chief economy is theft and begging." This is an incredibly insulting and racist comment and does an enormous disservice to our community. Such a statement would be inexcusable if directed at any other community and we strongly believe that it is equally inexcusable when directed at the Roma.

The RCC believes the above statement by Levant to be in violation of:

The following provisions of the *CAB Code of Ethics*:

Clause 2 – Human Rights

Clause 6 – Full, Fair and Proper Representation

The following provisions of the *CAB Equitable Portrayal Code*:

- (1) Equitable Portrayal
- (2) Human Rights
- (3) Negative Portrayal
- (4) Stereotyping
- (5) Stigmatization and Victimization
- (7) Degrading Material
- (9) Language and Terminology

The following provisions of the *RTDNA Code of Ethics*:

Article One – Accuracy

Article Two – Equality

Article Nine – Fair Trial

STATEMENT #3 [sic] BY LEVANT

"Gypsies aren't a race, they're not a religion, they're not a linguistic group. They're the medieval prototype of the Occupy Wall Street movement. A shiftless group of hoboes that doesn't believe in property rights for themselves – they're nomads – or for others. They rob people blind. Now the scourge has come to Canada through fake refugee claims." (01:44-02:00)

Here Levant directly negates and denies Roma identity equating our entire community with a "shiftless group of hoboes," "rob[ing] people blind" and a "scourge." In fact, the Roma are an official ethno-cultural and ethno-racial community recognized by the United Nations and numerous countries throughout the world (including Canada). The Roma do in fact have their own language, religious traditions and distinct historical identity that has been preserved in spite of statelessness and centuries of persecution. Again, Levant uses crude stereotyping to equate our entire community with criminality.

The RCC believes the above statement by Levant to be in violation of:

The following provisions of the *CAB Code of Ethics*:

Clause 2 – Human Rights

Clause 6 – Full, Fair and Proper Representation

The following provisions of the *CAB Equitable Portrayal Code*:

- (1) Equitable Portrayal
- (2) Human Rights
- (3) Negative Portrayal
- (4) Stereotyping
- (5) Stigmatization and Victimization
- (7) Degrading Material
- (9) Language and Terminology

The following provisions of the *RTDNA Code of Ethics*:

Article One – Accuracy

Article Two – Equality

Article Nine – Fair Trial

STATEMENT #4 BY LEVANT

"Look at this list of suspects released by Durham police. Gypsy after gypsy after gypsy. They gypped their way into Canada and now they're gypping the rest of us. Look at this, Dinarca Calderas, wanted for stealing two cars, money laundering, theft, fraud. Gypsy. Look at that, not on her own, as part of a criminal organization. We're used to biker gangs, we're used to the Hells Angels, the Mafia. They're not races or religions, they're cultural groups, subcultures, deviant groups that chose to steal for a living. Look at this! Ovidio Calderas, criminal organization, fraud. It's not all non-violent, no way, as I told you on Friday, in Italy, Gypsies are charged with murder at least six times more frequently than their population would suggest." (02:23-03:02)

Here Levant again engages in gross over-generalization about Roma and uses statements that misinform the public in order to denigrate our entire community. The statement "Gypsy after Gypsy after Gypsy" is particularly problematic when read alongside the statement that follows immediately afterwards: "They gypped their way into Canada and now they're gypping the rest of us." It is worth noting that it is largely Hungarian Roma that are making refugee claims in Canada since they are fleeing increasing persecution at the hands of the far right-wing, neo-fascist Jobbik Party and their paramilitary arm, the Magyar Garda. Jobbik is now the third largest party in Hungary's parliament. Jobbik and Magyar Garda activists have been implicated in killings, assaults and other hate-crimes targeting Hungary's Roma. Those individuals arrested by Durham Police and whom Levant is referring to were largely – though not exclusively – Roma from Romania; some were refugee claimants, some were landed immigrants and others were Canadian citizens. To make the jump from the arrests of a small group of Romanian Roma to delegitimizing the refugee claims of all Hungarian Roma in Canada represents a logical fallacy. Furthermore, Levant again denies Roma identity, likening Roma instead to "deviant groups" like the "Hells Angels" or "the Mafia." Finally, without providing any citations, Levant produces a dubious statistic about murder charges (not convictions) in Italy that is not in any way related to the Durham arrests. This is hardly an accurate, comprehensive, fair, full and unbiased attempt to address the deeply discriminatory context in which Roma live and does little to address the much higher rates of unemployment, lower life expectancy and systemic discrimination that confront Roma everywhere.

The RCC believes the above statement by Levant to be in violation of:

The following provisions of the *CAB Code of Ethics*:

Clause 2 – Human Rights

Clause 6 – Full, Fair and Proper Representation

The following provisions of the *CAB Equitable Portrayal Code*:

(1) Equitable Portrayal

- (2) Human Rights
- (3) Negative Portrayal
- (4) Stereotyping
- (5) Stigmatization and Victimization
- (7) Degrading Material
- (9) Language and Terminology

The following provisions of the *RTDNA Code of Ethics*:

Article One – Accuracy

Article Two – Equality

Article Nine – Fair Trial

STATEMENT #5 BY LEVANT

"For Gypsies it [crime] is a family affair, in fact, women and children are the best at it because we liberal Canadians or Europeans would never expect a child or a mom or both working together." (03:42-03:51)

This is a deeply racist comment, suggesting that in Roma culture crime is 'a family affair.' When paired with previous statements of this nature, the discriminatory, racist and offensive nature of such a comment should be clear. Once again, Levant takes one instance – the arrest of a small group of Roma by Durham police – to extrapolate criminal intentions to the entire community. Furthermore, the racist nature of the comment is highlighted by the fact that the Roma are treated as a distinct category from 'liberal Canadians or Europeans'; this in spite of the fact that Roma have been part of the fabric of Canadian society since the early 1900s and have lived in Europe for centuries. Roma are just as 'Canadian' or 'European' as anyone else residing in these places, and can be just as 'liberal' or 'conservative' as anyone else in spite of what Levant suggests.

The RCC believes the above statement by Levant to be in violation of:

The following provisions of the *CAB Code of Ethics*:

Clause 2 – Human Rights

Clause 6 – Full, Fair and Proper Representation

The following provisions of the *CAB Equitable Portrayal Code*:

(1) Equitable Portrayal

- (2) Human Rights
- (3) Negative Portrayal
- (4) Stereotyping
- (5) Stigmatization and Victimization
- (7) Degrading Material
- (9) Language and Terminology

The following provisions of the *RTDNA Code of Ethics*:

Article One – Accuracy

Article Two – Equality

Article Three – Fair Trial

STATEMENT #6 BY LEVANT

"Every last one of them [suspects] is a Gypsy. Just some of the 5000 who've gamed our system and our causing a 'Made in Europe' crime wave on our streets." (03:55-04:03)

Here Levant links the arrest of a group of Roma by Durham police and uses this as the basis for a broader generalization about all Roma who've recently arrived in Canada from Hungary (following the rise of the far-right Jobbik party and its paramilitary arm, the Magyar Garda). Extrapolating from 29 individuals arrested to 5000 members of the Roma community is an incredible leap in logic, suggesting that Levant is less concerned with a balanced portrayal of our community than with making gross generalizations and engaging in crude forms of ethnic stereotyping. He thus accuses the Roma community as a whole of "causing a 'Made in Europe' crime wave on our streets."

The RCC believes this statement to be in violation of:

The following provisions of the *CAB Code of Ethics*:

Clause 2 – Human Rights

Clause 6 – Full, Fair and Proper Representation

The following provisions of the *CAB Equitable Portrayal Code*:

- (1) Equitable Portrayal
- (2) Human Rights

- (3) Negative Portrayal
- (4) Stereotyping
- (5) Stigmatization and Victimization
- (7) Degrading Material
- (9) Language and Terminology

The following provisions of the *RTDNA Code of Ethics*:

Article One – Accuracy

Article Two – Equality

Article Three – Fair Trial

STATEMENT #7 BY LEVANT

“Roma’ is the name of a kind of tomato as you know, but that’s what some people call Gypsies. You can call them whatever you like if you’re arresting them, that’s fine by me.”
(05:37-05:45)

Here Levant once again belittles the naming practices of our community, supporting instead the use of the more offensive term ‘Gypsies’. He then goes on to suggest that the Canadian state and police officials should arrest anyone who is a ‘Gypsy’. In this passage, Levant goes beyond merely engaging in crude ethnic stereotyping to calling for Canada’s security and policing apparatus to be mobilized for the purposes of incarcerating people merely on the basis of their identity. In effect, Levant is here advocating state-directed violence against a specific group in violation of the *CAB Violence Code*. The suggestion made by Levant that “You can call [Roma] whatever you like if you’re arresting them” is particularly troubling given the history of state-directed violence, persecution, and genocide against the Roma community.

The RCC believes this statement to be in violation of:

The following provisions of the *CAB Violence Code*:

8.0 – Violence Against Specific Groups

The following provisions of the *CAB Code of Ethics*:

Clause 2 – Human Rights

Clause 6 – Full, Fair and Proper Representation

The following provisions of the *CAB Equitable Portrayal Code*:

- (1) Equitable Portrayal
- (2) Human Rights
- (3) Negative Portrayal
- (4) Stereotyping
- (5) Stigmatization and Victimization
- (7) Degrading Material
- (9) Language and Terminology

The following provisions of the *RTDNA Code of Ethics*:

Article One – Accuracy

Article Two – Equality

Article Three – Fair Trial

STATEMENT #8 BY LEVANT

“29 people, 236 charges that we know about so far. There are 5000 of these Gypsies here!” (05:58-06:04)

Here again, as in Statement #6 and Statement #7, Levant jumps from those arrested to insinuating that the whole Roma community (and particularly those who've arrived in Canada in recent years) are inherently criminal.

The RCC believes this statement to be in violation of:

The following provisions of the *CAB Code of Ethics*:

Clause 2 – Human Rights

Clause 6 – Full, Fair and Proper Representation

The following provisions of the *CAB Equitable Portrayal Code*:

- (1) Equitable Portrayal
- (2) Human Rights
- (3) Negative Portrayal
- (4) Stereotyping

(5) Stigmatization and Victimization

(7) Degrading Material

(9) Language and Terminology

The following provisions of the *RTDNA Code of Ethics*:

Article One – Accuracy

Article Two – Equality

Article Three – Fair Trial

STATEMENT #9 BY LEVANT

“They’re gypping us. Sorry, that’s a word for a reason, they’re thieves! And women and children, their own wives and kids, are the main tools of it!” (07:19-07:27)

Here Levant again uses the ethno-racial slur ‘gypping’ to stereotype our entire community and equate all Roma with crime. Again, he implies that criminal activity is an inherent part of Roma family life. These statements, once again, serve to misinform the viewing public about our community and to perpetuate some of the most retrograde and racist forms of ethnic stereotyping possible.

The RCC believes this statement to be in violation of:

The following provisions of the *CAB Code of Ethics*:

Clause 2 – Human Rights

Clause 6 – Full, Fair and Proper Representation

The following provisions of the *CAB Equitable Portrayal Code*:

(1) Equitable Portrayal

(2) Human Rights

(3) Negative Portrayal

(4) Stereotyping

(5) Stigmatization and Victimization

(7) Degrading Material

(9) Language and Terminology

The following provisions of the *RTDNA Code of Ethics*:

Article One – Accuracy

Article Two – Equality

Article Three – Fair Trial

STATEMENT #10 BY LEVANT

“Stealing is part of their family-crime organization. Being a Gypsy isn’t like being Black, or being Gay, or being a woman or even Romanian, where many Gypsies come from. Just like being from Sicily doesn’t make you part of the Mafia. Being a Gypsy is a positive choice, like being a Blood or a Crip, like joining the Cosa Nostra. For centuries, these roving highway gangs have mocked the law and robbed their way across Europe. Now, because of our broken refugee system, they’re here in Canada in the thousands. And they’ve brought the Gypsy Crime Wave with them. Yeah, no thanks, I’m not interested in calling them ‘Roma’ or ‘Travelers’ or having a Human Rights Commission investigate where we as a society have done them wrong, maybe dispatching social workers (laughs); the social workers will just have their wallets stolen. I want to dispatch cops and send the bad Gypsies to Hungary on the next plane. Just warn the flight attendants (chuckles) not to wear any jewelry on the flight!” (07:38-08:33)

Here again Levant: (1) implies that crime is a ‘family’ affair in the Roma community; (2) denies our identity as a community, implying instead that: “Being a Gypsy is a positive choice, like being a Blood or a Crip [i.e. street gangs in Los Angeles], like joining the Cosa Nostra [i.e. the Mafia]”; (3) equates our community with “roving highway gangs” and claims that for “centuries” our community has “mocked the law and robbed their way across Europe”; (4) again employs the racist term ‘Gypsy Crime Wave’; (5) explicitly states that he’s not interested in using non-offensive terminology for our community; and finally, (6) he suggests that social workers or flight attendants involved in deporting members of our community should be cautious since the very act of coming into contact with Roma may allegedly result in losing one’s valuables. The narrative developed by Levant in this last passage (and throughout the segment in question) constitutes a blatant example of prejudicial racial stereotyping.

The RCC believes this statement to be in violation of:

The following provisions of the *CAB Code of Ethics*:

Clause 2 – Human Rights

Clause 6 – Full, Fair and Proper Representation

The following provisions of the *CAB Equitable Portrayal Code*:

(1) Equitable Portrayal

- (2) Human Rights
- (3) Negative Portrayal
- (4) Stereotyping
- (5) Stigmatization and Victimization
- (7) Degrading Material
- (9) Language and Terminology

The following provisions of the *RTDNA Code of Ethics*:

Article One – Accuracy

Article Two – Equality

Article Three – Fair Trial

File 12/13-0104

The following complaint of September 7, 2012 was sent to the CRTC and forwarded to the CBSC:

My complaint is about racism directed at Roma people by Ezra Levant on Sun TV. It aired on *The Source* September 5 2012, the segment was titled “The Jew vs. The Gypsies”.

The broadcast is full of ethnic slurs. Mr. Levant says that all gypsies are thieves and criminals, that their culture is based on criminal activity, that Roma people aren't a real ethnic/religious/linguistic group, that they are all thieves and have been robbing Europe blind for centuries and now they are coming to Canada to do the same thing here.

I believe in freedom of speech and I have never made a complaint like this before but I am disgusted that a Canadian television network would actually broadcast this kind of blatantly racist attack against a group of people.

The CBSC wrote back to the complainant, explaining that it needed him to identify the time of broadcast in order to proceed with his complaint. He wrote back on September 17 with that information:

It aired on Sept. 5th on Sun TV on the program *The Source*, which I believe is broadcast from 5:00-6:00. I don't recall the exact time.

File 12/13-0113

The CBSC received the following complaint on September 17, 2012:

I am sending a complaint about the following:

Program: *The Source with Ezra Levant*

Date: Wednesday September 5, 2012

Time: 5 pm Eastern Daylight Time

Aired on: Sun News Network (CKXT-DT)

Toronto, Ontario (Bell Fibe TV Channel 1531)

My complaint:

I am writing about a recent broadcast by Ezra Levant, host of *The Source with Ezra Levant*. I saw the show on Sun TV (Bell channel 1531), and subsequently found it on the Sun website in order to transcribe the contents.

Titled "The Jew vs. the Gypsies," Mr. Levant's broadcast is nothing less than hate speech: an egregious outpouring of untruths and racism, (some frighteningly similar to Nazi epithets of Hitler's time) and parroting negative stereotypes that have followed our people since arriving in Europe in the late 14th and early 15th centuries. Mr. Levant exploits the recent arrests of members of a Romani crime ring in Canada for his own ends: to demonize all Roma, particularly those who have come from Hungary since the rise of the far-right neo-Nazi, anti-Roma, anti-Jewish Jobbik party. (With 47 members – one third – of the current Hungarian Parliament, Jobbik's paramilitary groups Magyar Garda and Civil Guard have terrorized Roma communities in pogroms carried out over the past several years.)

Some of Mr. Levant's words and phrases ("scourge", "deviant", "Gypsy crime wave", "gypped their way into Canada") echo Nazi descriptors of Roma: "asocials" (along with prostitutes, beggars, petty criminals and vagrants, outside 'normal' society); "racial inferiors" (along with Jews and Blacks); "aliens" (having "alien" blood); and, along with Jews, "Untermenschen" or "non-persons". Mr. Levant's diatribe recalls the mission of the Nazi regime's Central Office to "Combat the Gypsy Nuisance", opened in Munich, 1936. And it brings to mind Nazi Germany's December 1937 decree on "crime prevention," which a United States Holocaust Memorial Museum pamphlet says "provided the pretext for major police roundups of Gypsies", who were subsequently sent to Nazi death camps to be murdered alongside Jews. (<http://www.holocaust-trc.org/sinti.htm>; http://www.ushmm.org/wlc/en/media_da.php?ModuleId=10005219&MediaId=101).

My association of Mr. Levant's hate speech with that of the Nazi regime is not unfounded in that they both characterize Roma as inherently criminal. The on-screen text "Gypsy Crime in Canada" accompanies segments of his clip. He promotes arrests of Roma and

calls for mass removal ("Now the scourge has come to Canada through fake refugee claims"), saying that "they gypped their way into Canada and now they're gypping the rest of us." He continues: "They're gypping us. Sorry, that's a word for a reason, they're thieves! And women and children, their own wives and kids, are the main tools of it! You can call them whatever you like if you're arresting them, that's fine by me."

In labelling Roma as thieves, and promoting this stereotype as an inherent trait, he says of the alleged crime ring arrested in Canada, "Every last one of them is a Gypsy. Just some of the 5000 who've gamed our system and are causing a 'Made in Europe' crime wave on our streets. I want to dispatch cops and send the bad Gypsies to Hungary on the next plane. Just warn the flight attendants not to wear any jewellery on the flight!"

Anticipating strong objection, he defends his bigoted claims by saying, "Let me stop before you start blowing your hate crime whistle at me for saying 'Gypsy' or 'gypped'. See, political correctness and euphemisms like calling them 'Roma' instead of Gypsy or as the BBC calls them 'Travellers,' well the point of that is to obscure the truth. They're Gypsies and one of the central characteristics of that culture is that their chief economy is theft and begging. Sorry, it's true!"

In 1979, Roma were recognized as a people and granted NGO status by the United Nations. However, Mr. Levant tells his audience that we are not a real people, dismissing Romani history, identity and language. Roma are a distinct ethnic group, having left northern India around 1,000 years ago, and speaking Romanes, a Sanskrit-based language. (Did Mr. Levant, as a child, ever eat a lollipop? This word was derived from the Romanes language he claims doesn't exist.)

"'Roma' is the name of a kind of tomato, as you know, but that's what some people call Gypsies. You can call them whatever you like if you're arresting them, that's fine by me. Gypsies aren't a race, they're not a religion, they're not a linguistic group.... Being a Gypsy isn't like being Black, or being Gay, or being a woman Being a Gypsy is a positive choice, like being a Blood or a Crip, like joining the Cosa Nostra. For centuries, these roving highway gangs have mocked the law and robbed their way across Europe. Now, because of our broken refugee system, they're here in Canada in the thousands. And they've brought the Gypsy crime wave with them. Yeah, no thanks, I'm not interested in calling them 'Roma' or 'Travelers' or having a human rights commission investigate where we as a society have done them wrong, maybe dispatching social workers; the social workers will just have their wallets stolen."

I believe that Mr. Levant's "The Jew vs. the Gypsies" rant could be seen as an incitement to anti-Roma violence: one comment – now removed from the Sun Media website along with Levant's outburst – proposed that bullets, not the legal system, should be used to deal with our people. If you read "Jew" instead of "Gypsy" in the transcript, and "jewed" instead of "gypped", it would be evident how these historical hatreds and untruths are still embedded in common misapprehensions.

For the record, in Canada, along with esteemed author, historian and former lecturer at University of Toronto Ronald Lee, we count among our Romani population community workers, university professors/school teachers, writers, poets, university students (undergraduate and postgraduate, including law school), paralegals, small business

owners, hairdressers, butchers, fashion designers, medical technicians, accountants, chefs, high school and community college students, activists, artists, ethnomusicologists, musicians.

My concerns are that

(i) Ezra Levant's broadcast is hate speech at its most extreme, bringing a dangerous and virulent anti-Roma precedent to Canada, similar to Hungary's Jobbik diatribes in its viciousness;

(ii) this type of slander may promote anti-Roma hate speech and will seriously harm the acceptance and integration of Romani refugees fleeing extreme-right persecution in Hungary, and

(iii) such hate speech has no place on public airwaves in Canada.

Broadcaster Response

Sun News Network responded to all of the complainants on September 27:

I am legal counsel to the Sun News Network. I am writing in response to [the complainant]'s complaint to the CBSC set out below, concerning a segment broadcast on the Sun News program *The Source* on September 5, 2012. The segment in question was the opening monologue aired at the outset of the program, which was broadcast at 5:00 pm and 10:00 pm.

Sun News agrees that the opening monologue on that date concerning the Roma people should not have been broadcast and that it was an error of judgment to permit the segment to go to air. Sun News broadcast the following apology to the Roma people, and to Sun News viewers, on September 17, 2012. The apology was broadcast on two occasions on that date, first during the 5:00 pm airing of *The Source*, and later during prime time:

Text of Roma apology

Two weeks ago on the Sun News program *The Source* we looked at the issue of Canadian refugee claims by the Roma people.

Following the broadcast we received a number of complaints from viewers who felt the broadcast reinforced negative stereotypes about the Roma people.

We have completed a review of the material and we agree that this content was inappropriate and should not have gone to air.

It was not the intent of Sun News, or anyone employed by Sun News, to promote negative stereotypes about the Roma people.

We regret our error in these broadcasts, and we apologize unreservedly to the Roma people and to you, our viewers.

Sun News is on your side.

In view of the broadcast of this apology, Sun News submits that no further action by the CBSC is necessary in this instance.

Additional Correspondence

File 12/13-0069

The Roma Community Centre submitted its Ruling Request on October 1:

Please find attached the Roma Community Centre's (RCC) response to the Sun News Network. The RCC would like the CBSC to proceed with a full assessment of our initial complaint since the broadcaster in question has failed to address our concerns or to understand the gravity of Ezra Levant's deeply racist segment "The Jew vs. The Gypsies."

We trust that the CBSC will act on the grave violations of Canadian broadcasting standards that resulted from the airing of this segment. We also ask that Sun News act in accordance with our requests outlined in the appended response. The RCC is willing to work with both the CBSC and the Sun News Network in rectifying the damage done by Levant's nearly 9-minutes of on-air hate-speech against our community.

The following letter was attached:

Dear CBSC:

We are writing to express our dissatisfaction with the Sun News Network's response to our complaint. We would like to request that a full CBSC panel convene to consider our objections to 'The Jew vs. the Gypsies' that aired on *The Source with Ezra Levant* on 5 September 2012 (see CBSC File C12/13-0069). We feel the broadcaster's response fails to reflect the gravity of Levant's nearly 9-minute on-air racist hate-speech against our community. We would like to enumerate at least five reasons why we continue to be dissatisfied with the Sun News Network's weak response to such a serious breach of Canadian broadcasting standards and human rights norms:

- 1) Referring to the segment as simply an 'error in judgment', 'inappropriate' or merely reflecting 'negative stereotypes' is not sufficient. **Levant's words were deliberately calculated racist hate-speech. We want the Sun News Network and Levant himself to publicly recognize the racism involved and to take active measures to counteract the damage already done to our community as a result.**

- 2) In spite of what the broadcaster claims, the segment wasn't about 'the issue of Canadian refugee claims by the Roma people' since most of the segment used the recent arrest of a number of alleged criminals in order to denigrate our community as a whole. **The refugee issue is totally unrelated to the arrests made since the accused are allegedly from Romania, while Roma refugees in Canada are overwhelmingly from Hungary. Levant makes no mention of the racist persecution faced by Roma in Hungary** at the hands of far-rightwing parties like Jobbik, and paramilitary organizations such as the Magyar Garda, Civil Patrol and the Hungarian National Front. Similarly, Levant fails to mention the anti-democratic measures taken in the past year by the ruling FIDESZ party. **This context is essential for understanding why it is specifically Hungarian Roma that are making refugee claims in Canada.**

- 3) The broadcaster claims that it was 'not the intent of Sun News, or anyone employed by Sun News to promote negative stereotypes about the Roma people,' yet this is exactly what occurred. **Levant explicitly stated during the segment that he didn't care that he was engaging in hate speech, explicitly indicating a very deliberate intention to do so.** We believe it is worth repeating one of Levant's statements during the broadcast: *"Let me stop before you start blowing your hate crime whistle at me for saying 'Gypsy' or 'gyped'. See, political correctness and euphemisms like calling them 'Roma' instead of 'Gypsy' or as the BBC calls them, 'Travelers', well the point of that is to obscure the truth. They're Gypsies and one of the central characteristics of that culture is that their chief economy is theft and begging. Sorry, it's true!"* (00:58-01:19). This statement **demonstrates a very conscious and deliberate intention to perpetuate racist hate speech.**

- 4) **None of the false claims and lies spread by Levant have been directly debunked or challenged in the Sun News Network's apology.** In fact, those statements remain unchallenged, while the broadcaster continues to use the offensive term 'Gypsy' in referring to our community during its news broadcasts. We are particularly concerned that Levant denied the core of our identity by stating that we do not have a language, are not an ethnicity and that 'Roma' is only *'the name of a tomato'*. Levant then goes on to state that being Roma is 'a positive choice' akin to joining criminal organizations like the Blood/Crips or the Mafia. In fact, **Levant's use of the 'Gypsy Crime' trope throughout the segment echoes the discourse of far-rightwing groups in Hungary and the anti-Roma rhetoric of the Nazis in the 1930s and 1940s** (leading to the mass killing of an estimated 1.5-million European Roma during the Holocaust).

- 5) The Sun News Network's apology was aired without anyone who had filed a complaint being directly informed. **The length of the apology was nowhere near the amount of time that Levant took to libel our community and there is no public record of this apology online.**

In addition to requesting a full CBSC review of the broadcast in question, **we would also like to make the following requests of the Sun News Network:**

- 1) Given that Levant has not issued a personal, on-air apology for his nearly 9-minute hate-filled diatribe against our community, **we demand that the Sun News Network dismiss Levant.** The broadcast represents the longest and most sustained on-air broadcasts of hate-speech against any community in Canada since our organization was established in 1997. **We cannot imagine circumstances in which a host would retain his job after directing such hate-speech against any other community. Levant deliberately vilified Canadian Roma through the crudest racist vitriol. His actions demonstrate a total lack of professional judgment and are sufficient evidence of the unsuitability for Canadian television.** We hope that Levant undertakes serious introspection as to the roots of his anti-Roma racism.
- 2) **We demand that the network publish the full text of its apology – incorporating the above concerns directly into the text – on the SunNewsNetwork.ca website and on the website of *The Source with Ezra Levant*. We ask that this statement remain visible on both websites for a period of six months and that the broadcaster include a link to the RCC website** for more information on current issues facing Canadian Roma. We also recommend that the broadcaster make a charitable donation to Amnesty International's European Roma programs.
- 3) **Finally, we request that the Sun News Network grant an equivalent amount of time as that of the original segment to an expert on Roma issues** (in order to read a statement that will educate the public on the history of the Roma and the current challenges the community faces in Europe and Canada). **We request that this expert be chosen in consultation with the Roma Community Centre (RCC).** We would propose that the statement be read by either [the Executive Director of the RCC], [an RCC Board Member] or [a professor of Romani studies].

We trust that the CBSC will make a fair ruling on this matter, reflecting the full gravity of Levant's breaches of Canadian broadcasting codes. We also expect that the Sun News Network will respond favorably to our demands and act in a manner that is becoming of a major news organization. The Roma Community Centre (RCC) will continue to monitor the Sun News Network's portrayal of our community and will pursue all avenues in preventing further instances of anti-Roma hate speech. We are willing to work with Sun News to train their staff, editorial board and journalists on issues of concern to the Roma. Only by adopting a respectful approach to our community, that recognizes the full gravity of Levant's actions and proceeds accordingly, will we be able to believe that: "Sun News is on your side."

File 12/13-0104

The complainant in this file first sent an email rebuttal to Sun on September 27:

With all due respect, promoting negative stereotypes about Roma people was the entire point of the broadcast, claiming otherwise is ridiculous. Saying that the "content was inappropriate and should not have gone to air" while the person who made the racist

attack, Ezra Levant, says nothing and takes no responsibility for what he said is a pretty empty apology as far as I'm concerned.

He then submitted his Ruling Request using the CBSC's webform that same day, reiterating his view of Sun's response:

I am not satisfied with the response I received. Promoting negative stereotypes about Roma people was the entire point of the broadcast, claiming otherwise is ridiculous. Saying that the "content was inappropriate and should not have gone to air" while the person who made the racist attack, Ezra Levant, says nothing and takes no responsibility for what he said is a pretty empty apology as far as I'm concerned. They also say nothing in their so-called apology to refute the lies about Roma people that they broadcast, that should be the very least they are required to do.

File 12/13-0113

The complainant submitted her Ruling Request via email on October 1:

As I have told you in our telephone conversation this morning, I'm not satisfied with the Sun News response to me concerning my complaint about Ezra Levant's broadcast 'The Jew vs the Gypsies', and am requesting a CBSC ruling (Please see below and attached. I have also attached two images from Sun News which are related to my complaint.)

I am dissatisfied with the inadequate response of Sun News, which fails to address the concerns I raised in my complaint. Contrary to the opening statement of the Sun News' 'text of Roma apology' accompanying [Sun News Network Director of Legal Affairs]'s message, I feel that the 'issue of refugee claims' wasn't being looked at at all. The news item that inspired Mr. Levant was, in my view, a vehicle for him to vent his anti-Romani prejudice. Sun News seems to have already paved the way for an attitude of categorizing Roma as criminals. (Please see screen shots attached: "Gypsy group fuelling crime in Toronto, critics say"; "'Significant criminal activity' among Gypsies".)

Mr. Levant's statements were devoid of any informed discussion on the subject of refugee claims. He denied the existence of Roma as a people. (Another viewer goes further, suggesting to me that since Levant denied that Roma are a people, his rant strayed into Holocaust denial territory – Roma were considered 'Untermenschen' – non-persons – by the Nazis, and murdered together with Jews in the death camps.) Levant said we are a 'scourge', that we are inherently criminal, and we are 'gypping' our way across Canada. (As I mentioned in my initial complaint, his language echoes Nazi descriptors of Roma: 'asocials', 'racial inferiors', 'aliens'.) Such epithets have no relationship whatsoever to the issue of refugee claims. They do, rather, have a relationship to ignorance and hate.

The apology states that Sun News received complaints, and subsequently decided the content of Mr. Levant's broadcast was 'inappropriate and should not have gone to air'. Was this broadcast deemed 'inappropriate' because there were complaints? And if there had been no complaints, would it still have been 'inappropriate' to broadcast? We'll never know the answer to that; but what we do know is that Sun News must have

considered it perfectly suitable to broadcast without giving any prior thought to Mr. Levant's vilification of an entire people, otherwise this invective would never have seen the light of day. Hate speech is much, much worse than 'inappropriate'; and unfortunately no apology can remove the damage that was done by Mr. Levant's diatribe against our people. I therefore disagree that Sun News or Ezra Levant had 'no intent ... to provide negative stereotypes about the Roma people.' Even the title, "The Jew vs. the Gypsies" sets the stage for clear intent. Almost nine minutes of invective is no accident. How can Mr. Levant 'unintentionally' provide negative stereotypes, given that he appeared to be perfectly aware of what he was saying: 'Let me stop before you start blowing your hate crime whistle at me'.

As a second-generation, professional middle-class Canadian whose father was English Romani, I find both the broadcast and the Sun News response to my complaint to be a personal affront. The public backlash from publicly-aired hate speech such as this may well find its way to Roma refugees from Hungary – a vulnerable sector of Toronto's population – and especially to their children who are now attending school here.

Now that Sun News is admitting to promoting negative stereotypes about Roma, as much airtime should be devoted to setting the record straight. (I believe most of their shows are broadcast more than once, so the correction should be repeated at least as often.) This correction should also be on the website, and hateful comments prohibited.

Nowhere does the apology state that the content of the broadcast is racist and hateful. Describing the broadcast as an 'error' and 'inappropriate' are simply not sufficient. Nowhere does Sun News offer a public retraction, nor does Mr. Levant personally offer an apology, either on-air or on Sun's website. The lies that have been broadcast are not directly countered, and no action has been taken (or suggested) to actually correct them to any/all viewers who watched the original rant.

Sun News ("Sun News is on your side") has not, to my knowledge, aired any broadcasts that reflect the above statement – broadcasts that explore the growing neo-Nazi extremism and the conditions that are forcing Hungarian Roma to flee to Canada; broadcasts that would correct the misinformation given to the audience of *The Source with Ezra Levant*.

I feel that [Sun News Network's Director of Legal Affairs] did not address the content of my complaint:

- that Mr. Levant's "The Jew vs. the Gypsies" is hateful;
- that it is slanderous against a recognizable ethnic group;
- that it could be seen as an incitement to anti-Roma hatred or even violence as evidenced by comments online (now removed), including one that suggested Roma be dealt with not by law but with bullets.

Further, I feel that Sun News should put a respectable distance between their organization and Mr. Levant, cut him loose, and remove his broadcasts from the air.

I am not satisfied with this inadequate effort on the part of Sun News to deal with this matter. I therefore request a ruling by a CBSC panel.

Subsequent Developments

The CBSC put the files on hold due to other investigations taking place into this matter. Then, in April 2013, the CBSC contacted the complainants and broadcaster to ask if they had any additional information they wished to provide now that the process was resuming after being on hold for many months. Two of the three complainants did so, as well as Sun News Network.

File 12/13-0069

The Roma Community Centre sent the following email on April 19:

Thank you for your most recent note.

We really appreciate the CBSC's continued commitment to processing our complaint and are happy to hear that you are now proceeding with case file C12/13-0069.

[...]

We understand that Mr. Levant apologized on air during a March 17th broadcast on the Sun News Network. The Roma Community Centre does not accept the apology, since during the broadcast Mr. Levant continued to employ the derogatory term 'Gypsy' when referring to our community. He made no attempt to educate the public on why his comments would be deemed offensive and racist. In fact, we strongly believe that the apology was motivated more by the Sun Media Corp.'s forthcoming 'must carry' application to the CRTC than any sincere concern on Mr. Levant's part for our community or remorse for his comments. Since making his hateful comments against our community he has continued to use offensive, derogatory and frankly racist language in reference to other communities in Canada, including with reference to indigenous peoples, Muslim-Canadians, etc.

We believe that it is essential that the CBSC rule on the episode in question and that it clearly outline the multiple violations of broadcasting standards committed by Mr. Levant. This was not a one-off comment, or a slip of the tongue, but a scripted, intentional, 9-minute harangue against our community. Again, this is almost unprecedented in Canadian broadcasting and must be dealt with in a manner that will ensure that such hate broadcasts not be repeated again on the airwaves.

Thank you for your time and consideration and we look forward to your final decision. Please let us know the timeline for the process and if the CBSC requires additional resources or documentation from our end.

The RCC also sent the CBSC copies of two press releases it issued:

April 21, 2013

Stop Hate Speech Now! Say No to Anti-Roma Racism in Canada

Rally Against Racist Ezra Levant And Sun Media To Protest Against Their Hate Speech Towards Our Community.

We wait everybody who thinks that Ezra Levant should not continue his hate speech.

It is really important that we not allow hate speeches like that.

We meet at the Roma Community Center (1344 Bloor Street West, Toronto) on Tuesday, April 23rd, at 11:30, and go together to the place of our rally.

Let's make a difference together!

OPRE ROMA!

Link: <https://www.facebook.com/events/278002729002480/>

Fully supporting the egalitarian norm that hate speech has absolutely no place in a free and democratic society, Canada's Romani community and supporters will rally Tuesday, April 23, to urge the Canadian Radio-Television Telecommunications Commission (CRTC) to refuse Sun Media Corp.'s 'mandatory distribution' application. We will demand that this media outlet fire Ezra Levant following his nationally broadcasted xenophobic anti-Roma commentary.

Though Levant has formally 'apologized' for his on-air comments, this only came after intense legal and public pressure. The Romani community rejects this apology because Levant has continued to use the discriminatory term 'Gypsy' in reference to our community. The apology seems to have been conditioned more by Sun Media Corp's 'mandatory distribution' application than a sincere change of heart by Levant. Levant continues to spew hatred and vitriol against other communities as well, including indigenous people in this country. Let's be clear: Racism has no place on our airwaves!

Join us on Tuesday, April 23rd, in front of the CRTC's offices in Toronto to send a clear message that we will not accept racist broadcasts and to demonstrate that we do not believe taxpayers should be subsidizing such messaging.

SPEAKERS:

Gina Csanyi-Robah, Executive Director, Roma Community Centre

Borys Wrzesnewskyj, former Member of Parliament

Robi Botos, jazz musician and community activist

More speakers to be confirmed

Michael Butch of The Gypsy Rebels will be performing and electrifying the crowd with the band's hip and unique mix of traditional melodies and jazz, funk and reggae!

Canada's Romani community holds protest opposing Sun Media Corp.'s 'must-carry' application following Ezra Levant's hateful on-air comments

As CRTC hearings begin, racist rant compels community to call for rejection of the application and demand the firing of the Sun News Network commentator

News Release

Tuesday, April 23, 2013

For Immediate Release

TORONTO – On the same day Sun Media Corp. presented its case to the Canadian Radio-Television Commission (CRTC) regarding a mandatory distribution licence, Canada's Romani community and supporters rallied today outside the CRTC's Toronto office to urge the national regulator to refuse Sun Media Corp.'s application and to demand the media outlet fire Ezra Levant following his nationally broadcasted xenophobic anti-Roma commentary on the Sun News Network.

"Ezra Levant not only viciously attacked and attempted to rob the Roma community of its dignity, he has also attacked many other communities in the past," said protest organizer Gina Csanyi-Robah, executive director of the Roma Community Centre. "Given that Sun Media appears unwilling to part ways with Levant after his hateful commentary, which would have been the ethical thing to do, the CRTC cannot reward his employer with the opportunity to invade Canadian homes and force Canadians to subsidize the media company some \$18,000,000 so that he can expose our children and youth to further vile rants."

The Roma Community Centre invited Bernie M. Farber, human rights activist and former CEO of the Canadian Jewish Congress, to speak at the demonstration.

"Many of us remain very concerned that, notwithstanding the apology offered six months after the clearly hateful remarks made by Ezra Levant against the Roma community, the effects still linger," said Farber. "The CRTC must carefully determine, given the Sun News record, whether it is in Canadian broadcasting's best interests to grant its request for a basic cable licence."

Canadian-Romani jazz musician and community activist Robi Botos also spoke at the protest.

"As a musician, I have travelled all over the world and I have praised Canada everywhere I have been," said Botos. "I used to be proud telling people how I don't face racism in Canada. That changed last September. I was with my family at home and watched Ezra Levant's racist rant on TV. I have never felt so disappointed since I have been in this

country. I didn't know what to tell my children, they were shocked. You cannot promote hatred in Canada, especially not on national television."

Former Member of Parliament Borys Wrzesnewskyj also addressed the gathered crowd.

Although Mr. Levant has formally 'apologized' for his on-air comments, only after intense legal and public pressure, the Romani community has rejected the apology because Mr. Levant has continued to use the discriminatory term 'Gypsy' in reference to the community. The apology seems to have been conditioned more by Sun Media Corp.'s 'mandatory distribution' application, rather than a sincere change of heart by Mr. Levant. Mr. Levant continues to spew hatred and vitriol against other communities as well, including indigenous people in this country.

On Sept. 5, 2012, Mr. Levant made the following malicious comments broadcasted live throughout Canada on the Sun News Network (full transcript attached):

"Gypsies aren't a race, they aren't a religion, they aren't a linguistic group. They're the medieval prototype of the Occupy Wall Street movement, a shiftless group of hobos that doesn't believe in property rights for themselves – they're nomads – or for others, they rob people blind! (00:00:09.60)

"Let me stop before you start blowing your hate crime whistle at me for saying Gypsy or gyped. See, political correctness and euphemisms like calling them 'Roma' instead of Gypsy or as the BBC calls them 'Travelers,' well the point of that is to obscure the truth. They're Gypsies and one of the central characteristics of that culture is that their chief economy is theft and begging." (00:58-01:19)

"Being Gypsy isn't like being Black, or being gay, or being a woman, or even Romanian, where many Gypsies come from – just like being from Sicily doesn't make you part of the Mafia. Being Gypsy is a positive choice. Like being a Blood or a Crip. Like joining the Cosa Nostra. For centuries these roving highway gangs have mocked the law and robbed their way across Europe." (00:07:43.41)

"Yeah. No thanks. I'm not interested in calling them Roma, or Travellers, or having a Human Rights Commission investigate what we as a society have done them wrong and maybe dispatching social workers to them. Hah! The social workers will just have their wallets stolen." (00:08:14.58)

-30-

For more information, please contact:

Gina Csanyi-Robah

Executive Director, Roma Community Centre

Email: gina@romatoronto.org

Tel.: (416) 561-0770

File 12/13-0113

The complainant sent an email on April 19:

Thank you for your update on my complaint to CBSC (File C12/13-0113) about Ezra Levant's 'The Jew vs the Gypsies' on *The Source*.

At this point, I have no new information for your review of this complaint. Although I note that Mr. Levant recently made an on-air apology, several things concern me. After the offending broadcast, there was a notable silence from Mr. Levant (although Sun News apologized on-air) until over 6 months after it was aired. Frankly, it was too little too late. I question the timing of the apology, following as it did closely on the heels of Sun Media's application to CRTC for status as a mandatory cable TV station.

In Mr. Levant's apology he once again used the offensive term 'Gypsy'; he offered no insight or effort to educate the public about the racist misrepresentations and hateful stereotypes uttered in 'The Jew vs the Gypsies', or about their harmful effects upon the Roma community.

I feel that hate speech must not go unchecked; and Mr. Levant's thin apology does not erase the effects of his rant. Canadians of all backgrounds must be able to feel safe in this country. I therefore uphold my complaint.

Please do not close this file.

I appreciate being kept updated about the progress of this matter.

Additional Broadcaster Letter

Sun News submitted an additional letter to the complainants and CBSC on May 9:

Sun News welcomes the opportunity to make a further submission with respect to this matter. As noted in our previous response to this complaint dated September 27, 2012, Sun News broadcast an apology to the Roma people on September 17, 2012. That apology stated unequivocally that the monologue originally broadcast on *The Source* on September 5, 2012 was broadcast in error and should not have been aired.

Subsequently, on March 18, 2013, Ezra Levant, the host of *The Source*, made a further apology at the beginning of the show. In that statement, Mr. Levant apologized for his September 5, 2012 monologue and said that in it, he had made the "moral mistake of judging people collectively", rather than individually.

In addition, while internet content is not the responsibility of the CBSC, Sun News wishes to note that it has removed all instances of online posting of the September 5 broadcast that are within in its control. It has also made continued efforts to ensure that others do not post the broadcast online.

Sun Media submits that it has shown its good faith in apologizing for the September 5, 2012 broadcast, both to the Roma community and to its viewers, and that, in the circumstances, there is no reason for further action on this matter by the CBSC.

The full text of Ezra Levant's March 18, 2013 statement follows.

Text of statement of Ezra Levant broadcast on March 18, 2013 at 5:00 pm

"I host the most controversial news show in Canada, *The Source*.

"If there's some politically correct sacred cow out there, it's my job to barbecue it. From exposing David Suzuki's outrageous speaking fees to taking a run at corrupt Indian chiefs, I do it with gusto every day. I try to be entertaining as well as informative, using drama and sarcasm, and the occasional dance moves. And I always make sure to poke the most fun at myself – including reading gems from my hate mail every day.

"Last summer, I talked about a grave problem in Ontario – a 400-person crime ring, all recent immigrants from Romania, busted by Durham Regional Police. I let it rip against crime and immigration fraud, and for the most part it was just a pretty good rant, the kind I love to do, poking fun at the gypsies who had been arrested, and even poking fun at myself as a Jew.

"There were some criticisms afterwards, but I dismissed them as coming from the usual soft-on-crime liberals and grievance groups. But when I look at some of the words I used last summer – like "the gypsies have gyped us" – I must admit that I did more than just attack a crime or immigration fraud problem. I attacked a particular group, and painted them all with the same brush. And to those I hurt, I'm sorry.

"As a Canadian citizen and a journalist, I enjoy freedom of speech. Without that right, we would not be a democracy. But as someone who seeks to influence the public debate, I have to think about the words I choose. It's just wrong to slur a group of people. I made the moral mistake of judging people collectively.

"I owe a duty to my employer, who has allowed me to be the freest journalist in Canada, and has defended me against every attempt to silence me. I owe a duty to my viewers to give them the most thoughtful arguments I can. And I owe it to my own philosophy of liberty to judge people as individuals.

"As the philosopher Ayn Rand explained, the problem with stereotyping is that it's "the lowest, most crudely primitive form of collectivism. It is the notion of ascribing moral, social or political significance to a man's genetic lineage ... that a man is to be judged, not by his own character and actions, but by the characters and actions of a collective of ancestors.

“There's nothing wrong with going after a criminal gang. But it's wrong to brand an entire community with a broad brush – I wouldn't like it as a Jew, and the whole point of my crusade against the *Indian Act* is to free ordinary Indians from the corrupt chiefs who rule them. I am an anti-racism activist.

“I remain concerned about immigration fraud and crime gangs, but I can be better in the way I express those concerns.

“*The Source* is a show about ideas. I want my words to spur debate. When my show is finished on any given day, I want viewers to discuss these matters at the dinner table and write their MPs.

“I don't apologize simply for the sake of being consistent in my views. I regret having made these statements and I'm hopeful that those remarks will serve as an example of what not to do when commenting on social issues. I have the privilege of commenting regularly in this forum and I'm committed to doing so responsibly.”